U.S. District Court Southern District of Florida (Miami) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:25-cv-22582-RAR

Llorente et al v. El Benaye Assigned to: Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II Cause: 42:11601 International Child Abduction Remedies Act

<u>Plaintiff</u>

Juan Valero Llorente

Date Filed: 06/06/2025 Jury Demand: None Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory Actions Jurisdiction: Federal Question

represented by Benjamin Joseph Tyler

Holland & Knight LLP 701 Brickell Ave Suite 3300 Miami, FL 33131 305-789-7598 Email: benjamin.tyler@hklaw.com *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Brett Alan Barfield

PAG Law PLLC Attn: Brett Barfield 1627 Brickell Avenue Apt. 401 Miami, FL 33129 786-281-6691 Email: brett@pag.law *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Philip E. Rothschild

Holland & Knight 515 E Las Olas Boulevard Suite 1200 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301 954-468-7881 Email: phil.rothschild@hklaw.com *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Frances Guasch De La Guardia

Holland & Knight 701 Brickell Avenue Suite 3000 Miami, FL 33131 305-789-7619 Fax: 305-789-7799 Email: frances.guasch@hklaw.com

<u>Plaintiff</u>

Africa Llorente Horcajo

represented by Benjamin Joseph Tyler

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Brett Alan Barfield

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Philip E. Rothschild

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Frances Guasch De La Guardia

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye

represented by Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye

4070 SW 49th Ct. Fort Lauderdale, FL 33314 PRO SE

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/11/2025	<u>31</u>	ORDER GRANTING PETITIONERS' SECOND MOTION FOR EXPEDITED DISCOVERY. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/11/2025. See attached document for full details. (koy) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/11/2025	30	PAPERLESS ORDER denying with leave to refile <u>26</u> Respondent's Motion for Protective Order.
		Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c) allows a party to move for a protective order, but it also requires that "the motion must include a certification that the movant has in good faith conferred or attempted to confer with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action."
		Here, the Respondent, proceeding <i>pro se</i> , is requesting a protective order regarding certain matters related to discovery, but does not aver that she has met and conferred with Petitioners' counsel regarding the scope of the requested relief. The Court also notes that, in an abundance of caution, it has <i>sua sponte</i> sealed several of Respondent's filings in order to protect and keep confidential Respondent's information and that of her minor children. <i>See</i> [ECF Nos. 24, 27]. From Respondent's Motion, it is not clear if the Court's proactive efforts are sufficient to address her safety concerns, or what the scope of any additional protective order might be.

		To that end, because Respondent appears to be alleging sufficient good cause, as required by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c) (authorizing the Court to issue a protective order "for good cause"), the Court urges the parties to meet and confer to determine what the proper scope of a protective order might be.
		Accordingly, the Motion is hereby DENIED <i>with leave to refile</i> , once Respondent has met and conferred with Petitioners' counsel about the requested relief.
		Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/11/2025. (koy) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/11/2025	<u>29</u>	ORDER REFERRING CASE to Volunteer Attorney Program. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz II on 7/11/2025. <i>See attached document for full details</i> . (gp) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/11/2025	<u>28</u>	Second MOTION to Expedite <i>Discovery</i> by Africa Llorente Horcajo, Juan Valero Llorente. (Tyler, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/11/2025		SYSTEM ENTRY - Docket Entry 25 [respm] restricted/sealed until further notice. (gp) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/11/2025	27	PAPERLESS ORDER. The Clerk of Court is DIRECTED to seal [ECF No. 25] until further order of the Court. <i>See</i> Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.2(a), (c), (d); S.D. Fla. Loc. R. 5.4; S.D. Fla. CM/ECF Admin. P. 6A. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5.2.(a) prohibits filings that contain the name of an individual known to be a minor, while Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5.2.(c) provides for limited public access in immigration cases.
		Further, while the filing of discovery production on the public docket would ordinarily be stricken, <i>see</i> S.D. Fla. Loc. R. 26.1(b), the Court will nevertheless permit this filing to remain on the docket in order to facilitate the expedited nature of the proceedings under the Hague Convention. But the filing shall be SEALED due to the sensitivity of the information provided by Respondent. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz II on 7/11/2025. (gp) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/11/2025	<u>26</u>	MOTION for Protective Order Regarding Discovery Responses and Sensitive Information by Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye. (ebz) (Entered: 07/11/2025)
07/09/2025		SYSTEM ENTRY - Docket Entry 20 [answer] restricted/sealed until further notice. (amb) (Entered: 07/10/2025)
07/09/2025	24	PAPERLESS ORDER. The Clerk of Court is DIRECTED to seal [ECF No. 20] until further order of the Court. <i>See</i> Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.2(a), (c), (d); S.D. Fla. Loc. R. 5.4; S.D. Fla. CM/ECF Admin. P. 6A. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5.2.(a) prohibits filings that contain the name of an individual known to be a minor, while Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5.2.(c) provides for limited public access in immigration cases.
		Further, while the filing of interrogatory answers on the public docket would ordinarily be stricken, see S.D. Fla. Loc. R. 26.1(b), the Court will nevertheless permit this filing to remain on the docket in order to facilitate the expedited nature of the proceedings under the Hague Convention. But the filing shall be SEALED due to the sensitivity of the information provided by Respondent. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz II on 7/9/2025. (gp) (Entered: 07/09/2025)

07/09/2025	23	PAPERLESS ORDER on Interpreter Services for Final Hearing. The Court advises the parties that no court-appointed interpretation services will be available for the Final Hearing, scheduled for July 22, 2025 at 9:00 A.M. If the services of an interpreter are required, the parties will need to provide such services. Moreover, if the parties require testing over video conference to facilitate any interpretation services, the Court requests that they promptly advise that such testing is required. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/9/2025. (koy) (Entered: 07/09/2025)
07/09/2025	22	ORDER GRANTING RESPONDENT'S MOTION FOR EXPEDITED DISCOVERY. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/9/2025. See attached document for full details. (koy) (Entered: 07/09/2025)
07/09/2025	<u>21</u>	Notice of Service of Interrogatories and Request for Court Action re 20 Answer to Complaint by Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye. (ebz) (Entered: 07/09/2025)
07/07/2025	<u>19</u>	Response to Verified Complaint by Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye. (ebz) (Entered: 07/08/2025)
07/03/2025	<u>18</u>	ORDER ON RESPONDENT'S OMNIBUS MOTION. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/3/2025. <i>See attached document for full details</i> . (koy) (Entered: 07/03/2025)
07/03/2025	<u>17</u>	MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION, PROTECTIVE ORDER, REQUEST FOR INTERROGATORIES, ANDPSYCHOLOGICAL AND MEDICAL EVALUATION re <u>16</u> Order on Motion to Expedite by Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye. (ebz) (Entered: 07/03/2025)
07/02/2025	<u>16</u>	ORDER GRANTING PETITIONERS' MOTION FOR EXPEDITED DISCOVERY. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/2/2025. <i>See attached document for full details</i> . (koy) (Entered: 07/02/2025)
07/02/2025	<u>15</u>	MOTION to Expedite <i>Discovery</i> by Africa Llorente Horcajo, Juan Valero Llorente. (Tyler, Benjamin) (Entered: 07/02/2025)
07/01/2025	<u>14</u>	ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 7/1/2025. See attached document for full details. (koy) (Entered: 07/01/2025)
06/30/2025	<u>13</u>	MOTION to Request Extension of Time to Submit Evidence by Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye. Responses due by 7/14/2025. (ebz) (Entered: 07/01/2025)
06/17/2025	12	OMNIBUS ORDER. The Final Hearing in this matter is SCHEDULED for <u>July 22</u> , <u>2025 at 9:00 A.M.</u> Respondent shall file a response to the Verified Petition on or before <u>July 1, 2025</u> . Exhibit List due by <u>July 15, 2025</u> . Witness List due by <u>July 15, <u>2025</u>. Bench memo due by <u>July 15, 2025</u>. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz II on 6/17/2025. See attached document for full details. (gp) (Entered: 06/17/2025)</u>
06/17/2025	11	PAPERLESS Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz II:
		Show Cause Hearing held on 6/17/2025. Order to follow.
		Respondent Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye and Children present in Court, Spanish interpreter present,

		Attorney Appearance(s): Brett Alan Barfield, Frances Guasch De La Guardia, Benjamin Joseph Tyler,
		Court Reporter: Ilona Lupowitz, 305-523-5737 / Ilona_lupowitz@flsd.uscourts.gov. (gp) (Entered: 06/17/2025)
06/12/2025	<u>10</u>	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF SERVICE as to Amal El Ahmadi El Benaye re DE <u>4</u> Order to Show Cause. (ebz) (Entered: 06/12/2025)
06/10/2025	<u>9</u>	ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO SERVE RESPONDENT AND TO CONTINUE SHOW CAUSE AND SCHEDULING HEARING. Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 6/10/2025. See attached document for full details. (koy) (Entered: 06/10/2025)
06/10/2025	8	MOTION for Extension of Time for the United States Marshal's Service to Serve Respondent re <u>4</u> Order to Show Cause, Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) sent, MOTION to Continue <i>Show Cause and Scheduling Hearing</i> re <u>4</u> Order to Show Cause, Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) sent, by Africa Llorente Horcajo, Juan Valero Llorente. Responses due by 6/24/2025. (Tyler, Benjamin) (Entered: 06/10/2025)
06/09/2025	7	CLERK'S NOTICE of Compliance re <u>4</u> Order to Show Cause, Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) sent. (A packet with the order, case filings and summons have been delivered to the US Marshal Service). (jas) (Entered: 06/09/2025)
06/09/2025	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Brett Alan Barfield on behalf of Africa Llorente HORCAJO, Juan Valero Llorente. Attorney Brett Alan Barfield added to party Africa Llorente HORCAJO(pty:pla), Attorney Brett Alan Barfield added to party Juan Valero Llorente(pty:pla). (Barfield, Brett) (Entered: 06/09/2025)
06/09/2025	5	Clerk's Notice Re Expedited Review - Pursuant to Court policy, petitions filed under The Hague Convention and ICARA should be resolved within six-weeks from the initial filing of the petition. See Internal Operating Procedures, Section 2.18.00, on the Courts website. (vjk) (Entered: 06/09/2025)
06/06/2025	<u>4</u>	SHOW CAUSE ORDER. Respondent shall appear before this Court on <u>June 11</u> , <u>2025, at 10:30 A.M.</u> in Courtroom 11-2, 11th Floor, at the Wilkie D. Ferguson, Jr. United States Courthouse, 400 North Miami Avenue, Miami, Florida 33128.
		Additional Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) sent to United States Marshal Service (public entries only)
		Signed by Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II on 6/6/2025. See attached document for full details. (koy) (Entered: 06/06/2025)
06/06/2025	<u>3</u>	Summons Issued as to Amal EL AHMADI EL BENAYE. (blc) (Entered: 06/06/2025)

06/06/2025	2	Clerks Notice of Judge Assignment to Judge Rodolfo A. Ruiz, II.
		Pursuant to 28 USC 636(c), the parties are hereby notified that the U.S. Magistrate Judge Lauren F. Louis is available to handle any or all proceedings in this case. If agreed, parties should complete and file the Consent form found on our website. It is not necessary to file a document indicating lack of consent. (blc) (Entered: 06/06/2025)
06/06/2025	1	COMPLAINT against Amal EL AHMADI EL BENAYE. Filing fees \$ 405.00 receipt number CFLSDC-18511082, filed by Juan Valero Llorente, Africa Llorente HORCAJO. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Divorce Order, # 2 Exhibit Joint Custody Agreement, # 3 Exhibit Spanish Central Authority Letter, # 4 Exhibit October 2022 Modification Order, # 5 Exhibit Grandmother Rights Order, # 6 Exhibit December 2023 Order, # 7 Exhibit May 16, 2024 Order, # 8 Exhibit May 22, 2024 Order, # 9 Exhibit Hague Application, # 10 Exhibit January 2025 Order, # 11 Exhibit Declaration from May 21, 2025 Hearing, # 12 Civil Cover Sheet, # 13 Summon(s), # 14 Text of Proposed Order)(De La Guardia, Frances) (Entered: 06/06/2025)