1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA WEST PALM BEACH DIVISION
3	CASE NO. 20-md-02924-ROSENBERG
4	IN RE: ZANTAC (RANITIDINE) .
5	PRODUCTS LIABILITY . West Palm Beach, FL LITIGATION January 19, 2023
6	•
7	
8	
9	STATUS CONFERENCE (through Zoom) BEFORE THE HONORABLE ROBIN L. ROSENBERG
10	UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
11	FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
12	ROBERT C. GILBERT, ESQ.
13	Kopelowitz Ostrow Ferguson Weiselberg Gilbert
14	2800 Ponce de Leon Boulevard Suite 1100
15	Miami, FL 33134 305-384-7270
16	ASHLEY C. KELLER, ESQ.
17	Keller Lenkner LLC 150 N. Riverside Plaza
18	Suite 4270 Chicago, IL 60606
19	312-741-5222
20	FOR THE DEFENDANTS: ANDREW T. BAYMAN, ESQ.
21	King & Spalding LLP 1180 Peachtree Street Suite 1600
22	Atlanta, GA 30309 404-572-4600
23	JULIA ZOUSMER, ESQ.
24	King & Spalding LLP 353 N. Clark Street 12th Floor
25	Chicago, IL 60654 312-995-6333

_	
1	ANAND AGNESHWAR, ESQ. Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP
2	250 West 55th Street New York, NY 10019 212-836-8011
4	
5	ANDREW D. KAPLAN, ESQ. Crowell & Morning LLP 1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
6	Washington, D.C. 20004 202-624-2500
7	THOMAS J. YOO, ESQ.
8	Holland & Knight LLP 400 Hope Street 8th Floor
9	Los Angeles, CA 90071 213-896-2400
10	
11	
12	Court Reporter: Pauline A. Stipes HON. ROBIN L. ROSENBERG
13	West Palm Beach/Ft. Pierce FL 561-803-3434
14	301 003 3434
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

THE COURT: All right. Good morning, everyone. We are here in the matter of In Re: Zantac Products Liability Litigation, MDL 2924, and we are here on the Zoom platform. We are here for a status conference that in many respects follows up from the status conference that we held on January 5th to review some of the topics that we began to discuss on that date.

There are a list of topics that I know I have provided to our special master, Jamie Dodge, and I believe she has shared those with the leadership who will be presenting today. They are the same topics that we discussed on January 5th.

So, consistent with how we handled the status conference last time, if I could ask those attorneys who are presenting on topics one and seven — I think I am going to combine those topics, that would be helpful. Once you are all on, we will have everybody state your appearance for the record.

I know that is always tough because you don't know who should go first. I could tell you in the order I see you on the screen, but I think we all see each other differently. I will let you go for it and state your appearance for the record.

Can everybody hear me okay?

MR. GILBERT: Yes. Good morning, on behalf of the Plaintiffs, Robert Gilbert and Ashley Keller addressing topics

one and seven.

MR. BAYMAN: Good morning, your Honor, Andrew Bayman, counsel for BI and also counsel for the brand Defendants on these matters. I along with my partner, Julia Zousmer, will be responding to your Honor's questions about these topics.

MS. ZOUSMER: Julia Zousmer on behalf of Boehringer Ingelheim and the brand Defendants, as Mr. Bayman just noted.

MR. YOO: Good morning, your Honor, Thomas Yoo. I will be speaking for the generics on topic one today.

MR. KAPLAN: Good morning, your Honor, Andrew Kaplan on behalf of the distributor Defendants.

MS. MAGUIRE: Good morning, your Honor, Robin Maguire on behalf of the retailer Defendants.

THE COURT: Good morning, everyone, nice to see you.

All right. In the interest of kind of laying the landscape, just sit back and listen for a minute, kind of much what I did the last time. I am going to -- and I have my prepared notes, as I usually do. I am going to lay out my questions thinking interest in hearing from you on these topics. I think they overlap to some extent, which is why I asked that everybody addressing topic one and topic seven get on the screen.

Topic one, as you may recall, is sort of the general topic of orders, judgments that need to be filed in personal injury cases in designated cancers, and topic seven is the

application of the Daubert order to the retailers and the distributors.

When I was going back over my notes and reviewing the transcript from January 5th, it seemed to me that there were enough overlapping issues that it would be helpful to talk about them together before we go on to the other topics.

Excuse me if I am diverting my eyes because I am looking at my notes to left of me, and when I am looking to the right, then I am looking at you on the screen.

The general goal of the question as to topic one was sort of how mechanically should final judgment be entered, what cases need final judgment, and when should final judgment be entered.

Some of the questions that I presented initially were that when the Plaintiffs sought Rule 58 final judgments to appeal the Court's Federal preemption rulings, the Court entered a final judgment on the MDL docket, and that judgment included an attachment, Exhibit A, and it listed all of the cases in which an individual Plaintiff had named only generic manufacturer Defendants.

And then the Court directed the Clerk of the Court to enter a copy of the final judgment in each individual case listed on Exhibit A. There were 18 cases on Exhibit A. So, I had questions about should the same procedure be used for the Court's general causation ruling, have the parties prepared a

list of the cases that qualify for final judgment -- I am summarizing a little bit so as not to be repetitive from the last time -- and should the Court enter final judgment as soon as possible, should the Court resolve pending non-designated cancer cases.

And the response, in summary, from my review of the transcript was that the Defendants want judgment entered as soon as possible, although they seem to suggest that the appropriate date may be the date the tolling ends for the registry, which is on or about April 5, 2023.

The Plaintiffs stated on January 5th that they were close to an agreement on this topic, and in fact, you forwarded a proposed joint order on January 18th, which I have as a proposed order styled Judgment in Cases Alleging Designated Cancers. You had a list included, and that had approximately 1,100 cases on the list.

In essence, the proposal seems simple and fairly straightforward insofar as it states that all designated cancers are due for final judgment. It recognizes that the appendix with the list of cases could have errors because of how difficult it is to create such a list.

The proposed order contemplates that once the order is entered, for 14 days the burden is on individual counsel to fix the list. They should inform the Court if a case he is on the list that shouldn't be, and inform the Court if a case isn't on

the list that should be, and if anyone points out an error, the order says the parties will give me a proposed order to address the error. Otherwise, after the 14-day correction period the Clerk of Court is directed to enter final judgment in each case on the list.

So, in connection with that I have several questions. Sit back and listen, you don't have to answer them just yet. Then I will move to topic seven, and then maybe you will understand the totality of what I am thinking.

So, the questions I have are, when considering the proposal to enter final judgment in designated cancer cases the Court observed that the proposed pretrial order that you sent does not expressly draw any distinction between cases that were filed or consolidated into the MDL prior to December 6 — that is the date the Daubert order was issued, summary judgment order — and cases filed or consolidated after December 6.

So, one of the first questions I want to hear you on is, does that distinction matter, cases that came in to the Court after December 6, after the order? And if the distinction doesn't matter in your view, meaning — when I say doesn't matter, that they are treated the same as cases that were before the Court before December 6 for purposes of entry of a final judgment based on the application of the Daubert order, summary judgment order.

So, if your position is that it doesn't matter, came

in on December 7, December 8, they are in, they are part of the MDL, they are governed by the Court's ruling, is there any difference between those cases and cases that have been coming in, direct filed from the registry, and presumably will continue to be coming in? I know the subject of how they come in, multi-Plaintiff complaints or not, is the subject of the briefing and the hearing that we had, and the Court is waiting on further briefing on that.

Regardless of how they come in, individual Plaintiff or multi-Plaintiff, they are coming in, and is there any difference between a case that was transferred in or direct filed on December 7, December 8, January 2nd, and this group of cases that have been and will continue to be coming in from the registry?

What the Court is getting at is that if I am to delay final judgment until after the claimants have filed their cases, which seemed to be contemplated at the last hearing until after that April 5 deadline, so final judgment is not going to be entered until then, would the cases that came in after December 6, and the ones that continue to come in, whether they were transferred in or direct filed in from the registry, or from anywhere else for that matter, would they be included on the appendix? Would that appendix of 1,100 become some larger appendix and be part of the final judgment that everybody is contemplating, at a minimum, that the Court would

be entering as to the brands' designated cancers?

We will talk about the nonbrands in a minute, but the thrust of this for now is something that you already had agreed to in that proposed PTO.

Alternatively, if you think the distinction matters — and I ask this because there was a comment made by Mr. Cheffo at the last hearing on January 5 — I keep saying January 5 — no, it was at the motion hearing on January 12.

So, there was the January 12 hearing on the multi-Plaintiff complaint issue, and in the transcript at page 27 he said, "as to the claimants that is, the claimants coming in, the Plaintiffs would file the tens of thousands of short complaints that they file. We would then get a printout of those, but let's assume we file just one motion saying, based on all these cases and your Honor's ruling, we would request that you grant summary judgment in, say, these 50,000 claims."

So, I need to understand that more. I need to understand, is there contemplating — contemplated a motion as to all those claims from the registry that are going to be filed, but not as to transferred cases coming in after December 6? So, I wanted to appreciate if there is a distinction between the two; if so, why, and what.

If you do believe there is a distinction, that is if the claimants could not be included on the cases that receive final judgment for some reason, but you are of the view that the transferred in cases or other direct filed cases post

December 6, then why wouldn't the same reason apply to post

December 6 cases?

Alternatively, the proposed order that you submitted to me, did that order treat post December 6 cases differently, but it is just not readily apparent or expressed because the post December 6 cases were not included on the list?

And if they were not included on the list, how would individual counsel know in those later filed cases if they should be treated differently? If they are, for example, left off that appendix without explanation, how would counsel for those post December 6 cases know that their cases are being treated differently?

So, maybe it just has to go to the fact that I don't completely understand what the intent was behind the proposed PTO or whether you had thought about it, but you can consider that issue as I move on.

A second question I have is -- and I would think the benefit of asking all my questions first is so that you can think about everything together before just sort of responding to individual issues.

So, the second issue has to do with the Court's entry of final judgment with respect to nonbrands. The question is: Shouldn't the Court's entry of final judgment wait until the Court has decided whether final judgment should be entered in

favor of nonbrands? The Court does not want to be in the position of directing the Clerk of the Court to enter final judgment multiple times, particularly when the Clerk is likely to be under pressure to process the filing all of these new cases that are coming in.

The proposal from the parties in that proposed PTO only directs the Clerk of the Court to enter final judgment in favor of the brands.

My followup question is, will the nonbrand

Defendants be moving for relief in the form of requesting the entry of final judgment in designated cancer cases? Many, if not almost all, of the short form complaints at one time or another checked boxes for nonbrand Defendants, and individual cases that have not kept their short form complaints up to date may still to this day have nonbrand Defendants listed as Defendants.

Although the Court previously had to grapple with the fact that short form complaints could be unilaterally amended at any time, the deadline for unilateral amendments has now passed and the short form complaints can only be amended with the Court's permission.

The third question ultimately is, I would want the parties, as they did before, to provide a form final judgment for the Clerk of the Court to enter. The Southern District of Florida Clerk of the Court does not enter final

judgment independently of a Court provided order for docketing.

Let me move on to topic seven because it fills out the questions I had. The focus in question six, in topic one was, you know, final judgment and drawing this distinction between pre December 6 and post December 6, and then claimants, and maybe you don't see a distinction. I am not intending to create something that you didn't contemplate, but the exchange that took place at the motion hearing, which I hope all of you, if not arguing, I know were listening in, dovetails with topic seven, which is final judgment also issue, and the application of the Daubert order to the retailers and the distributors, and I suppose to the generics as well.

I know that at the -- at the January 5th hearing the parties said they needed to confer on a process for adjudication of the short form complaints, that no party or attorney was aware of a short form complaint that had actually pled an independent claim for negligence, and I want to get confirmation of that.

I know one of the questions I asked was, does any party know of an individual claim that has been brought by an individual Plaintiff pursuant to pretrial order 31, section 2(b)(4)(N), that is not contained in the master complaints? And the distributors at the status conference on January 5th represented that they would be preparing a proposed procedure and submitting that proposal to the Court.

The parties' disagreement in the area seemed to pertain to whether nonbrands should receive a final judgment, so this is really getting to the crux of this topic.

If they do, then that would seem to take care of claims in the short form complaints. If they don't, perhaps there is no jurisdiction to enter the judgment as a result of the Court's prior Rule 54(b) certification. That was raised at the January 5th hearing and that's when the distributors discussed the possibility of moving for the entry of an indicative ruling, which is essentially a ruling that says if jurisdiction were returned to the District Court, this is how the District Court would rule.

I understand the parties now are discussing that a retailer/distributor motion on the subject is forthcoming.

These are the questions that I have surrounding this topic that I would be interested in what you have to say about it.

In the Court's ruling granting in part and denying in part the entry of Rule 58 and Rule 54(b) final judgment, it's on page 24 of that order, the Court entered Rule 58 final judgment in individual cases where — where the only Defendants named were generic manufacturing Defendants, and where the Plaintiffs waived their right to amend to add additional claims.

But in cases where only generic manufacturer

Defendants were named, and where the Defendants had not waived their right to amend, the Court noted, and I quote, "There is still a theoretical possibility that the individual Plaintiff could obtain relief in this MDL" and the Court declined to enter Rule 58 final judgment.

The Court's ruling as to the other nonbrand Defendants was much the same. For example, the Court noted that the Plaintiffs could in theory plead claims for ordinary negligence against retailer and distributor Defendants, and the Court accordingly declined to enter Rule 58 final judgment in favor of those Defendants as well.

Although the deadline has passed for the Plaintiffs to unilaterally amend their short form complaints, it does remain theoretically possible to this very day for the Plaintiffs to amend their short form complaints with Court permission and through that amendment to add claims against any Defendant, including the generics, retailers, and distributors.

By way of example, I pulled one. Now, this happened to be done without Court permission, meaning it was after the deadline, but presumably the person could ask for leave to do it. This is just one example, it's at case number 23-CV-80054, Docket Entry 4, filed on January 13, 2023, where a Plaintiff, Nathan Barker, filed a first amended short form complaint, version 2, and named brand name manufacturers, generic manufacturers, distributors and repackager, retailers and -- so

that is an example.

It therefore seems to the Court that, with the small exception of the very few generic only cases that received Rule 58 final judgments, that is those 18, every individual case in this MDL is alive. They would be alive for a few reasons, the Court believes, but again, I share all of this with you because I would like to hear your thoughts on it.

One is that the Plaintiffs can still amend, they can seek leave to amend. Two -- of their short form complaints.

Two, no Defendant has moved to dismiss the individual short form complaints.

And three, no final Rule 58 final judgment has been entered.

True, some of them may be barely alive, some of these individual cases, insofar as counsel may possess the belief that the Court should enter adverse rulings upon motion, but the Eleventh Circuit had this to say about the individual cases and individual short form complaints:

Mr. Cartee -- and I am quoting now from the mandate at page 18. "Mr. Cartee and Ms. Williams argue that their actions are more or less dead given the District Court's rulings dismissing certain claims from the MPIC, but there is a big difference between mostly dead and all dead. Mostly dead is slightly alive. It may be that the claims remaining in their amended short form complaints once paired with a viable and

pending MPIC have little hope of surviving given the District Court's rulings, but at the moment, there is no final ruling putting their operative complaints, the combination of the MPIC and individual SFCs, to rest. For that reason, we lack jurisdiction to consider their appeals. The Defendants' motions to dismiss these appeals are granted."

So, it seems to this Court that almost every individual case in this MDL remains alive, and it seems to this Court that the Eleventh Circuit holds the same view.

If almost every case remains alive, and every case has been consolidated into the MDL, why doesn't the Court's MDL ruling on general causation and summary judgment as to designated cancers apply with full force to the living active individual cases? Why doesn't the Court's ruling bind those cases?

The Court understands that the parties are disputing whether the nonbrand Defendants can avail themselves of the Court's ruling on general causation, but the Court does not fully understand this dispute. Why wouldn't the Court's ruling already be a part of every individual case's record?

It doesn't seem to be the case to the Court that because only the brands moved for Daubert exclusion, the other parties cannot avail themselves of the ruling, at least this is what — the question that I seek your input on.

The Court's ruling was not on brand causation, but on

general causation. The Court's ruling was not on a molecule manufactured solely by the brands. Ranitidine is Ranitidine and the ability of Ranitidine to cause cancer is the linchpin of every designated cancer claim in this MDL regardless of who was sued.

The Court's questions for the parties are two-fold.

First, aren't all individual cases, almost all of them, still alive? And if they are still alive, doesn't the Court's ruling on general causation apply to those cases? And if the Court's ruling on general causation applies, how can it be that the nonbrands cannot as a matter of law avail themselves of that ruling?

In other words, if the cases are alive, how can it be that there is no procedural avenue that the nonbrand Defendants can avail themselves of the Court's general causation ruling?

So, when the parties are addressing this issue, I would appreciate hearing answers to those questions.

So, I know that is a lot. I hope that you feel you sort of were adequately prepared coming into the hearing knowing from the last status conference what my general questions were. I drilled down a little bit more based on some of the things that you said at the last hearing and some feedback that I received in the interim from the special master about where you were in your discussions and, quite frankly, from receiving your own agreed upon PTO.

I don't know if you want to take a moment to confer either behind the scenes or otherwise on who would like to address these issues. It might benefit us to hear Plaintiffs' view first, and then that would give the Defendants a little bit of time to figure out who and how you want to address it from the Defendants' perspective. And I realize there is the brand and the nonbrand. I think hearing from everybody, however, would be helpful.

So, from the Plaintiffs.

MR. GILBERT: Thank you, your Honor, Robert Gilbert on behalf of the Plaintiffs. I am joined by Ashley Keller.

I am going to briefly address some of the topics and turn it over to my friend, Mr. Keller, to address your many questions and issues. There is a lot packed in there, as you warned, and we hope we can remember them all and address them all.

Let me first say something that is very clear, and I'm certain that my colleagues, Ms. Zousmer and Mr. Bayman, will concur with this when they have their opportunity to speak.

The conversations and discussions that I have had with them both before the January 5th CMC and since the January 5th CMC have been specifically relating solely to -- and now I am speaking about the proposed order that you referred to that we submitted on January 18th -- specifically relating solely to the brand Defendants, and it has been my understanding

throughout these conversations that it relates only -- that the Appendix A that the Defendants compiled and worked very hard on relate solely to cases that were pending as of the time of the Court's Daubert order.

There has never been any discussion during our prior meet and confers, of which there have been several, and there have been a number of emails exchanged, that any of the cases listed on Appendix A were directly filed in or transferred to this transferring Court after December 6th. It never came up.

So, while I -- while we appreciate the distinction you are drawing, and Mr. Keller is going to address it head on, I want to make sure that you know from these meet and confers what was discussed and what was not discussed because it is material here and directly relates to your questions.

And second of all, I know I don't need to say this, but I am going to say it anyway, the proposed agreed order that was submitted, this and the one with regard to non-designated cancers, obviously — specifically with regard to the designated cancers, while the form of those orders is agreed upon by the Plaintiffs, it preserves all of our objections and is not intended to waive any of our objections to the Court's Daubert and summary judgment rulings.

I just say that for the record.

Unlike the meet and confer process that we have had both before January 5th and since January 5th with the brand

Defendants' counsel, the meet and confers that were -- that took place with the generics, frankly, left much to be desired.

We promptly met and conferred with them right after January 5th. We did not receive a proposed final judgment from them until the eve of this hearing. We also and heard for the first time last night tat they were filing a brief on that issue, disappointing to say the least, and we made our position known to them during the meet and confer. Why it took until the eve of the hearing to receive their proposed order is unknown to us.

With regard to the distributors and retailers, we had productive conversation with Mr. Kaplan and Ms. Johnston.

While we disagree on the fundamental issue, I think that what we did agree on, and what Mr. Kaplan indicated to us as late as yesterday, was that they were going to be filing a motion on this issue after today's hearing that we would have the opportunity to respond to.

So, I'm going to now turn over the gavel, if I may, to Mr. Keller for us to try to unpack your many questions and issues.

THE COURT: Okay, thank you.

MR. KELLER: Thank you, your Honor, Ashley Keller for the Plaintiffs. You always retain the gavel, but I will take the baton from Mr. Gilbert. I tried to jot down all of your questions, but please interject if I missed anything or you

have any follow-ups.

With respect to direct filed versus transferred cases, I don't think that distinction makes any difference, so whether the case is transferred by the JPML or whether it is directly filed pursuant to the PTOs, that is not a distinction that at least I would suggest has any significance.

I do think there is significance, though, to the date of the filing, and this wouldn't apply to any of my clients, but in a leadership position I am thinking about all of the Plaintiffs. I don't harbor any illusions that your Honor is going to change your mind, for example, on something like preemption, but every Plaintiff has a due process right to make themselves heard and to present some arguments that potentially we missed.

So, formally speaking, if a Plaintiff wasn't on file and therefore didn't have an opportunity to raise his or her hand through counsel and say, here is an argument that your Honor needs to consider before you throw out all of my claims, I think they have a right to do that. So, whatever process you want to contemplate for someone who files, for example, tomorrow, I think it needs to give an opportunity for those Plaintiffs to be heard.

It can be streamlined and efficient. Something I have seen in other MDLs is an order to show cause process where a Plaintiff would have to show cause why your previous decision

shouldn't apply to him or her, but some sort of due process I think is required, and whichever Defendants are moving against a Plaintiff who shows up in your courtroom after prior decisions have already issued needs to be given that fair opportunity to respond to a summary judgment motion that would, you know, end that Plaintiff's actions.

So the date, I think, is the critical dividing line for due process purposes as opposed to direct file versus JPML transfer.

THE COURT: Let me ask you -- you are in leadership, and we have two of you in leadership on the Zoom. You represent everybody insofar as a leader, not as individual counsel, obviously. We know that is the differences in an MDL versus a class, but you continue in your role of leadership to this day. As leaders, are you aware, have you touched base, do you seek to guide the Court on what needs to occur, whether there are those who want to raise new issues that you, as leaders, did not raise in your Daubert or summary judgment or at any juncture in this three-year litigation, almost three years?

MR. KELLER: If the question is what type of process would I establish --

THE COURT: Are you aware of persons that you are leading that they want to be heard?

It is not a substitute for any process you may

ultimately propose and that I would consider, but what is your sense of the landscape right now in terms of cases that have come in post December 6th, transferred in, direct filed? Are you aware?

MR. KELLER: To be candid with your Honor, I don't even know how many cases have been filed since December 6th. I get the docket entries, but I have not, admittedly, been keeping a running tab. Of course, as leaders in this MDL for the plaintiffs we have certain responsibilities. It is a strange beast because we don't have an attorney/client relationship with the other Plaintiffs who come into this MDL. We have responsibilities, but it is not the same set of responsibilities or communications directly with those clients on a regular basis.

I don't have any insight to give you, unfortunately.

Maybe others on the Zoom do, but I can't answer that sitting

here today. I don't have anything intelligent to say about it.

THE COURT: This kind of dovetails a little bit into the -- and I will give Defense an opportunity to be heard -- a little bit into the other topic, but do you have any sense -- so a final judgment hasn't been entered. The case isn't over as to everybody except those 18 Plaintiffs that got the Rule 58. So, when you come into a case and there is no final judgment entered, what is the procedural landscape the Court should be considering?

I know you keep saying due process, and I know that is an important concept theoretically, and your answer to it, at least, you know, doing the best you can today, to suggest borrowing from experiences in other MDLs an order to show cause, and that doesn't seem necessarily unreasonable.

But with no final judgment being entered, and if a case is coming in are raising the designated -- as to the designated the cancers, how do the rules of procedure apply here in terms of why a final judgment that is ultimately entered, let's say in April, wouldn't apply without a procedure, let's say? Is it just -- not just, but the notion of due process, they came in, they haven't been heard, as distinct from what, the person who filed on December 5th?

What about the person who filed on December 5th, was he heard? You all had already filed your motion, you argued your motion. Did they have a chance to step up to the plate and say, no, I don't agree with what they are doing?

That is where I would like to sort of understand the rules. What is the procedural context in which I should be thinking about this?

MR. KELLER: The December 5th example is an interesting one, it is one I would like to think about more.

Let's put an pin in that because I don't have am answer off the cuff. The rules that apply are the rules that apply in every individual civil action. Your Honor has already held that

every Plaintiff has his or her own action, so the ordinary Rules of Civil Procedure apply.

The fact that you have already considered important legal and factual questions with a record that has been developed by others may have significant influence on what you do with respect to a new Plaintiff who has his or her own individual action, but Defendants still have to move for summary judgment in the ordinary course with respect to those new Plaintiffs, and your Honor has to rule on those summary judgment motions before you can issue a final judgment as to those Plaintiffs.

So there is no automatically you lose because you have just come into this MDL as a new Plaintiff.

THE COURT: In a non-MDL case, if you had a Plaintiff that was joined, say, after a motion to dismiss order was entered, an order on a motion to dismiss or even a summary judgment, or a defendant is brought in, would that mean that party automatically has the right to ask the Court to be heard on issues that had been litigated before they were added to the case?

MR. KELLER: I want to make sure I am understanding your question. When you say joined, do you mean joined into someone else's action or do you mean just brought in front of the Court?

THE COURT: Joined into the action.

MR. KELLER: That is a different context because now you are becoming a party to someone else's case, so there are rules with respect to joinder, voluntary and involuntary joinder, and I don't have an answer for you, but that could potentially be a different context.

The Plaintiffs that are filing actions now, subsequent to December 6th, they are not being joined. They are being consolidated under 1407, but as your Honor has already held, based on the Supreme Court's decision in Gelborn, (phon) every Plaintiff has an individual action, they are not joined as parties to someone else's action.

So, the person who your Honor referenced, I haven't had a moment to pull that docket entry, who amended the complaint, I don't know if they were on file many, many months before or if they were amending a recent filing. Someone who files on January 19, today, they are not joining the action of the thousand plus Plaintiffs who are subject to the exhibit that you were sent that is agreed to by the Plaintiffs and the brand Defendants. They have their own individual action the Defendants have to move to dismiss.

I don't think that there is any doubt that your Honor is going to grant summary judgment as to them, and I am not trying to relitigate issues on that hypothetical person's behalf, but your Honor has already adjudicated, but they do have a right to oppose summary judgment if they want to, or

they can say we respectfully disagree with your Daubert decision, but assuming you are going to stick with it, go ahead and enter judgment against me and we don't have to have a fight about it.

They have due process rights that are the ordinary due process rights that obtain for any Plaintiff who files his or her own case under the Rules of Civil Procedure.

THE COURT: Okay.

MS. ZOUSMER: Your Honor, may Defendants be heard on this issue before you move on?

THE COURT: Yes, just state your name.

MS. ZOUSMER: Julia Zousmer for the record.

THE COURT: Let's make sure Mr. Keller is finished.

We can hear from Defendants on the issue of sort of the difference between pre December 6 and post December 6, I suppose, before we talk about final judgment as to nonbrands.

Mr. Keller, is there anything more you wanted to say on that topic?

MR. KELLER: Not on that topic, thank you, your Honor.

THE COURT: So, I understood your position to be that you see no distinction between direct filed or transferred cases post December 6, but you do see a distinction between pre December 6 and post December 6, and that some form of process should be in place, whether it is an order to show cause or something else, so as to afford due process because you believe

as a matter of law, under law and the rules, that anyone brought in under December 6 is not necessarily and automatically bound by the Court's rulings without having some opportunity to be heard.

Is that kind of an accurate summary of what you said?

MR. KELLER: It is, your Honor.

THE COURT: Okay. Ms. Zousmer.

MS. ZOUSMER: Thank you, your Honor. With respect to the cases being filed or transferred, we agree with Mr. Keller that there is no distinction there.

In terms of the distinction of the cases that are filed before December 6 and after December 6, we also believe that there should be no distinction. I think that your example about the December 5th case that would be filed highlights why there is no distinction.

First of all, the registrants who would be filing cases after December 6th all certified that they would be bound by the Court's orders. So, with respect to any registrants who are filing cases after your Honor's Daubert and summary judgment order, those registrants should be treated like any filed case because they certified to be treated as any filed case in that regard.

In terms of the non-registrant new cases that are filed after December 6, the Daubert order should also apply to those cases because there is leadership in this MDL who is

empowered to choose the cancers that they designated and then to work with their experts and general causation opinions, litigate the motions, and the Court has ruled on the motions and — in other words, any new people — if those new people were in the MDL before the Court's Daubert ruling, they wouldn't have had the opportunity to litigate the motion, so that is the December 5 example.

For the same reason that we would think your Honor's opinion applies to the December 5th filed case, we would think the order applies to post December 6th filed cases because there is leadership in the MDL that was empowered to litigate this issue for Plaintiffs.

THE COURT: Okay. Did any other Defense counsel want to be heard on just this topic of kind of — it sounds like there is agreement between Plaintiff and Defense from what counsel who have spoken so far have said about no distinction between filed and transferred, but a distinction between pre and post December 6.

Is there anything else that anybody wants to add to that topic? If not, I am happy to move on to the next part of this topic.

MR. YOO: Your Honor, Thomas Yoo for the generics.

I am not sure if this is the right time to make these comments on behalf of the generics, but to the extent this relates to the proposed judgment we submitted, your Honor, I

want to make our views very clear with respect to the applicability of the Court's Daubert order.

As I indicated at the prior --

THE COURT: Sorry to interrupt, but I think you are going to be delving into the next part of the topic. In other words, you are now going to speak to the application of the Court's summary judgment order to nonbrands.

MR. YOO: Correct, your Honor.

THE COURT: Bear with me for a second.

Let's reserve that for one moment because I want to hear from Plaintiff first on that issue and then hear from Defense. I want to go back for a moment to what Ms. Zousmer said about the certification.

Is the certification that you are referring to that the claimants made part of Exhibit A to the PTO 37 where in Subsection B of the registry consent the claimants were saying — were agreeing that in order to negotiate PTOs each claimant agrees that lead counsel is authorized to represent them in these negotiations, and more broadly, to act on their behalf to the same extent as a filed Plaintiff in this MDL?

The scope of this authorization, is that set forth in PTO 20? I want to be clear I understand what you are referring to when you say the certification.

MS. ZOUSMER: I was referring to the certification process set forth in PTO 72, so the process by which the

registrants had to certify over the summer whether or not they were going to be certified Federal participants; and if so, that they would be bound by the Court's orders and subject to its jurisdiction and estopped from going to State Court.

So, checking the box, as we called it, for the registry claimants that PTO 72 sets forth is what I as referring to.

THE COURT: Okay. I wanted to be clear on that.

Since I understand Mr. Yoo's comments were going to be directed to how the Daubert order applies to nonbrands, that was the second part, topic seven.

Mr. Keller, did you want to be heard now on the series of questions that I asked with respect to topic seven, which in sum is based on, among other things, the Eleventh Circuit opinion, the mandate, and everything else that I laid out, you know. Aren't the short form complaints alive?

No final judgment has been entered as to anybody other than the 18, and why wouldn't -- and in fact, people are still amending and naming -- again, they should be seeking leave of Court. I am not saying it is being done properly procedurally, but why wouldn't any final judgment that is contemplated being entered as to designated cancers be equally contemplated as to brands as it is to nonbrands without any further motion practice, so to speak? And that would be as to the generics, retailers, and distributors.

MR. KELLER: Your Honor, I am happy to address that.

Again, Ashley Keller for the Plaintiffs.

Yes, the actions other than the ones with respect to Rule 58 are technically still alive, not all the way dead, or whatever the language that you previously quoted was, but it is not correct to say that there aren't final judgments that have already been entered. Your Honor entered a Rule 54(b) judgment.

So, look to the text of Rule 54(b), what it says is, normally, if you don't adjudicate all of the claims and all of the parties that is not final, and so you can still revise the previous decisions that resulted in the dismissal even with prejudice of certain claims.

If you say that there is no just reason for delay under Rule 54(b), you have made the claims or the parties that you certified pursuant to that order final judgments. Final means final, so they can no longer be revised.

With respect to the claims that your Honor fully dismissed, and this is quite distinguishable from Cartee where the Eleventh Circuit said the Court could have certified with respect to Mr. Cartee under Rule 54(b), but you didn't.

With respect to the question that you were asking earlier, you did certify, over Plaintiffs' objection, a Rule 54(b) judgment. So, all of the claims that you certified are gone and can no longer be subject to your Honor's Daubert

decision. There was the theoretical possibility left open that — apparently you found a example of a Plaintiff who availed himself of the opportunity to amend his complaint. With respect to any amended complaint that adds a claim that hasn't been already certified as final, I suppose you do have the opportunity with respect to that new claim to issue a judgment, but it still wouldn't be automatic.

Under Rule 56, you can't just enter summary judgment when a nonparty hasn't asked for it except with notice and an opportunity to be heard, and the generics, the retailers, and the distributors, they haven't asked for summary judgment at any time.

Moreover, with respect to the generics --

THE COURT: I am sorry, you say a nonparty. They are a nonparty, are they not, to the master complaint, which the Court did not find was the result of a full merger, and that the individual complaints still remained, and so they are parties in those short form complaints.

MR. KELLER: Well, it depends on your Rule 54(b) certification, which can be as to either claims or parties.

But when I said nonparty in the previous remarks, I meant nonparty to the summary judgment motion, that only the brands were a party to the summary judgment motion. The generics, the retailers, and the distributors never asked you to grant summary judgment as to any claim, including the

theoretical ones that could still be pleaded. Until your Honor found that example, I had seen no short form complaint that availed itself of that theoretical possibility to add, for example, a hot truck in the desert claim against the retailers.

I also respectfully disagree with your Honor's statement that general causation is general causation and it's not specific to the brands. Summary judgment is something that is adjudicated in the wake of a full evidentiary record. We don't have a full evidentiary record, for example, against the generics because they won and we lost.

Your Honor certified, under Rule 54(b), that every claim against them was out. We might have been able to test generic Ranitidine and found 20 million nanograms per pill. We might have used different experts to testify about the testing protocols with respect to generic Ranitidine. We never presented those hypothetical experts and they never opposed them because they didn't have to go through the full discovery process that normally obtains when you're a litigant in a case with live claims against you.

So, after giving them everything that they wanted, a final judgment on every claim that every Plaintiff had pleaded against them, not an almost final judgment, completely dead with respect to the actual short form complaints that people pleaded against generics, retailers, and distributors, it's too late now with respect at least to those claims, the ones that

you certified as final, for them to get the benefit of a Daubert process that they didn't participate in.

THE COURT: Okay. You have been heard in full on that issue?

MR. KELLER: Unless your Honor has further questions, yes, I have.

THE COURT: Okay. I may, but let's see what Defense has to say.

I know we are spending more time on these topics, but I think these were the meatiest topics of the status conference, just so you are aware.

How does Defense want to be heard? I suppose it is more of a nonbrand, although brands may have a view on the legal issue, but why don't we start with the nonbrands and we can circle back with the brands.

So, why don't we hear from Mr. Yoo, and then anyone else who wants to speak on behalf of any nonbrands, and then if the brands have anything to add.

Again, how should the Court be thinking about this in a legal context, or what should the Court be considering procedurally? What guides the Court procedurally to answer this question?

MR. YOO: Thank you, your Honor, Thomas Yoo for the generics. We have grappled with these issues, your Honor, and at least from our perspective, this is advanced civil procedure

to be sure, and I have had a lot of input from folks on my side. This is how we view the issues.

First of all, what is absolutely clear to us is the Court set up Daubert, heard Daubert, and ruled on Daubert for application to the litigation as a whole.

I don't need to remind the Court that the bellwether process and the deadlines and discovery and everything were directed toward the singular dispositive proceeding that would be had on the question of general causation. And so, for the Plaintiffs to now say, well, it wasn't really that dispositive, we only looked at certain issues, I think that is, frankly, without any merit whatsoever.

So, whether we look at it as collateral estoppel or law of the case, or look to pretrial orders -- Ms. Zousmer referred to some, but this docket is full of references to Plaintiffs' leadership acting on behalf of all Plaintiffs and claimants in the registry, and as your Honor pointed out, it was the Plaintiffs' leadership that decided what the designated cancers would be that would be tested for general causation on Daubert grounds.

So, we think the Court's finding there is no reliable evidence for general causation for designated cancers absolutely applies to every Plaintiff and to any and every Defendant named by any Plaintiff or claimant.

And as to Mr. Keller's last suggestion about the

Plaintiffs not having an opportunity to ask their experts to look at generic drugs, I think that is disingenuous. There was no limitation on what the Plaintiffs' experts would rely on for their general causation opinions. Your Honor may recall the generics provided a significant amount of discovery to the Plaintiffs before we were dismissed on preemptive grounds.

In addition, even after we were dismissed on preemption grounds, if the Plaintiffs felt they needed additional data from the generics, they could have subpoenaed us as third parties, I suppose.

So, to now come in and say their reports were somehow limited and Daubert didn't look at all general causation issues and evidence for the designated cancers I think is just wrong.

Now, the procedural issues are complicated, we agree. We have gone back and looked very carefully at the Court's ruling on the parties' motion for entry of final judgment, Docket Entry 4595. We have also looked closely at the judgment the Court previously entered, and here is our analysis, your Honor.

You entered final judgment in all generic only cases where a Notice of Appeal had been filed at the time of that judgment, which was November 2021. You also entered partial final judgment on 54(b) certification grounds in all mixed generic cases on file at that time, and any future mixed generic cases that would be filed.

You denied entry of final judgment in generic only cases where the Plaintiff had not filed a Notice of Appeal, and you also declined to enter final judgment in the class actions because you determined that that needed to await additional determinations.

So we have these two categories of cases where the generics had been named where we still need final judgment.

What we have submitted to your Honor for consideration and discussion today is a proposed final judgment relating to generic only cases that were not covered by the November 2021 judgment. So, those would be generic only cases where a Notice of Appeal had not been filed at that time, and any generic only cases that may be filed in the future.

We feel the time is right for the Court to enter that final judgment because the reason the Court declined to enter final judgment back in November 2021 was, as the Court mentioned today, there was the possibility that a Plaintiff could unilaterally amend his or her short form complaint to allege some other cause of action against the generics.

Well, Plaintiffs no longer have that ability, your Honor, and there are three reasons why. One is, no Plaintiff has amended his or her short form complaint to bring in such a cause of action since the time of the November 2021 judgment.

Additionally, the deadline to amend has now passed pursuant to the Court's pretrial order 78. And in addition,

based on the Court's Daubert ruling, it would be moot for a Plaintiff in a generic only case to seek to amend his or her short form complaint in a designated cancer case.

So, for all of those reasons we think the generics should be granted final judgment under Rule 58 in any current and future generic only cases.

As to class actions, your Honor, we would defer our request for entry of judgment until the Court rules on the pending motions and those issues are sorted out.

THE COURT: In response to Mr. Keller's comment that because I entered a Rule 54(b) as to some of the generics who didn't get the 58, that the Court is thereby precluded from now entering a Rule 58, do you have a response to that?

MR. YOO: We do struggle, your Honor, with the idea of getting a judgment after already having received a 54(b) judgment.

Now, as to the question of a motion for an indicative ruling, I would defer discussion on that to Mr. Kaplan, of course, but frankly, your Honor, our proposal right now we felt was in many ways the path of least resistence.

We have not ruled out the possibility that we may join in Mr. Kaplan's request, but we felt, given the complexity of these issues, the request for entry of a 50(a) judgment in generic only cases was what we should request of the Court at this time.

1 As to the mixed generic cases where the Court 2 previously granted 54(b) judgment, at this time we decided that we would not ask the Court to revisit that. 3 MR. KELLER: Your Honor, may I quickly respond? 4 5 THE COURT: Let me just make sure I understand. 6 generic only, remaining a Rule 58, that is, those that did not 7 get a 58 or a 54(b) before, you are saying a 58 now, and as to 8 the generics that received the 54(b), nothing? That is correct, your Honor. If you look at 9 MR. YOO: 10 the judgment you entered in November of '21, there is a 11 provision in there, we have been referring to it as a 12 continuing judgment provision, but there is a provision that 13 provides for application of your judgment to any future mixed 14 generic cases. And so we believe by virtue of that provision, 15 any subsequently filed mix generic case already has judgment 16 entered in that case, and that would also apply to any mixed 17 generic cases that are filed coming out of the registry. 18 THE COURT: What page of that order, do you know off

THE COURT: What page of that order, do you know off hand? So I know what you are referring to.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. YOO: So, this would be page five, your Honor, of Docket Entry 4664.

THE COURT: What language on page five, starting where?

MR. YOO: It's in the middle of paragraph three which says, "For mixed generic cases filed after the date of this

order, but which incorporate claims from the MPIC or NPIC, judgment shall be effective as of the date that an individual Plaintiff filed such a short form complaint."

Your Honor, I am not prepared today to address this in full, but we would be open to an opportunity to analyze whether there is a way for that part of the Court's prior judgment to be revisited and amended so that there — if there is a procedural vehicle the Court has in mind for application of the Daubert ruling to nonbrand Defendants, that be incorporated in an amended judgment.

I am just not prepared to lay out procedurally how that would work, but we would like an opportunity to consider that if that is something the Court may be interested in.

THE COURT: Okay. Okay. Before I hear back from Mr. Keller, though, let's hear from the other nonbrands if you want to be heard.

MR. KAPLAN: Good morning again, your Honor, Andrew Kaplan on behalf of the distributor Defendants, and for purposes of this issue, we coordinate with retailers, so I will convey the position of both groups at the moment.

I won't rehash what Mr. Yoo said, but we are in full agreement with the general applicability of the Daubert rulings, but as to the nonbrand Defendants, I will note -- I think Mr. Keller referenced us as nonparties. I think we were more technically nonmovants, but in terms of the specific

procedure contemplated, as Mr. Gilbert mentioned, we met and conferred and discussed generally what we would like, and we were not able to come to an agreement. We intend to file a motion, with the Court's permission, and we will be in a position to file that by Monday if the Court allows that, and at least in our discussion with Mr. Gilbert and Mr. Keller, we anticipated the normal Southern District of Florida local rules could apply for purposes of the timing and length of the briefing.

So I think that would -- if that were to occur, that would complete briefing by February 13th, if we filed on Monday.

THE COURT: What was the motion that you were going to file?

MR. KAPLAN: The motion more in detail, the motion would be seeking essentially two things; one would be the application of the Daubert general causation rulings to the distributors and retailers, and there are a couple of mechanisms for that.

And then for purposes of Count 7 of the MPIC, the M-P-I-C, which was the count that the Court declined to certify for judgment, for 54(b) judgment, and allowed time for the Plaintiffs to amend without leave, which has now passed, we would seek entry of final judgment on Count 7. In terms of —this is the timing issue that the Court's questions

anticipated -- we think that the application of the Daubert ruling to that count, which I think there is no dispute the Court has jurisdiction over, would go first, then Rule 58 judgment on that count.

At that point, once that is done, and this goes -- for those cases in which brands are also in there, or other parties are in there, that would close out, I believe, all of the claims against all of the parties with respect to those Plaintiffs' cases.

In terms of what -- for the counts that the Court did certify for appeal under 54(b), we think there is a jurisdictional issue in that the Court wouldn't be able to explicitly enter summary judgment, or apply the summary judgment necessarily on those counts. So, as we mentioned the last time we discussed this on January 5th, we will ask the Court to enter an indicative ruling essentially indicating that were the Court of Appeals to remand specifically for the limited purpose of applying the ruling, that the Court would then apply the ruling.

We will weigh all the legal support for that out in the motion. In fact, given the complexity of these issues, it would be better to address in a motion and briefing so both sides have the opportunity to provide you all the law and any questions that the Court had would be fully informed by the parties' positions. Would that help? 1 | THE COURT: Yes. Thank you.

MR. KAPLAN: Sorry, your Honor, one more side note.

The Court mentioned an example of a recently amended short form complaint, the Docket Number 23-CB-80054, the Nathan Barker claim, and I think there may have been a misunderstanding in Mr. Keller's comments, and I know he prefaced his comments with saying he didn't have that in front of him.

I think Mr. Keller suggested that there may have been an independent negligence claim asserted or a hot truck claim asserted in that. We had that pulled while we were speaking and that wasn't the case.

THE COURT: That is correct. I only used it as an example of Defendants being added as recently as January 13, to make the point of whether the cases were still alive or not, but no, it was not intended to be used as an example of a hot truck case.

MR. KAPLAN: Thank you, your Honor.

THE COURT: Anything else from nonbrands? What about from the brands on this issue?

MR. BAYMAN: Your Honor, Andrew Bayman for the brands. As Mr. Gilbert mentioned, we have not been part of the discussions with the generics, that has really been their issue. We didn't think we had a dog in the fight. We think, obviously, the order clearly applies to us, and we want to get

judgment entered.

In thinking about your Honor comments and thinking about these issues, I don't think your Honor's order is Defendant specific. I think your Honor says the linchpin of all of the claims in the MDL is the question of whether Ranitidine causes cancer. So, just reacting to it here in this discussion, we think that it should apply across the board, if you will.

As I say, we have not really been involved in these discussions, we have not had a reason to be and haven't been privy to all the arguments that have been made, but that is just our reaction based on a lot of the comments the Court made earlier.

THE COURT: Okay. I will turn back to Mr. Keller, but I want to be clear, and you can say what you want to say in addition, but is it Plaintiffs' position that a Rule 58 appeal subsumes an earlier Rule 54 appeal or not?

MR. KELLER: I am sorry, your Honor, could you clarify your question? I don't know what a Rule 58 subsequent appeal would look like.

THE COURT: Well, almost like if you have a trial record, say a case gets past summary judgment and it goes to trial, and the trial record subsumes the summary judgment record. I am trying to understand your position with respect to if one were to take an appeal — so, say there was the 54

appeal -- 54(b) appeal that we have in this case, then the case ends, and Rule 58 is entered, and another appeal is taken, but the Rule 54(b) never got the appellate ruling. Would the Rule 58 appeal subsume the prior appeal that was made on the 54(b)?

MR. KELLER: Got it, now I understand. No, your Honor. Normally you are exactly right, if you deny summary judgment and then you go through trial and develop a record, what Rule 54 says is that all of the orders are nonfinal and you can amend them. So you can look at your prior orders and amend them because there is not a final judgment yet.

Once you certified under Rule 54(b), those claims are gone. They are not almost final, you have made them completely final, so those claims are no longer in the case, which is why there is actually a tension between what you heard from Mr. You and Mr. Kaplan. At least the retailers and distributors realize they have to seek a conditional ruling from your Honor, and we'll oppose that in due course because we don't think it is proper.

They have at least recognized that those claims are gone and are in the Eleventh Circuit. Mr. Yoo said he might join what they are filing, but I think the generic's position is inconsistent with the retailers and distributors' position. They think they can still get a Rule 58 judgment even though you have already certified under Rule 54(b) that the claims against them are final.

The other points I wanted to raise really quickly, the same discovery point that I mentioned to your Honor with respect to the generics applies to the retailers as well.

Wal-Mart, for example, manufactured its own product. We didn't get full discovery from them, appropriately, because you dismissed every live claim against them. That could have changed the summary judgment record when you considered a properly filed Rule 56. So, I think that needs to be taken into account.

I will also say, I don't think I answered one of your questions about timing, should you delay entry of judgment vis-a-vis the brands while we consider all of these other issues. Obviously, you have discretion to do so, but the Plaintiffs' position is that you should not. The brands are entitled to a judgment, and nobody disputes that. As you see from the discussion we are having with respect to the nonbrands, if you ultimately disagree with the Plaintiffs' position, that is going to be messier.

We'll preserve all of our rights to tell the Eleventh Circuit, with nothing but respect to your Honor, you should not have issued a Rule 58 or a modified Rule 54. So, there is no reason for the brands to be slowed down by a more clean appellate process, that is just going to be a straight up review of your Daubert decision with these extra issues.

The final point I'll make, I think I heard Mr. Yoo say

things like law of the case or collateral estoppel could potentially be the reasons that they get the benefit of your Daubert decision. I am pretty familiar with those doctrines, I'll say off the cuff I don't think they apply, but we shouldn't be at a case management conference throwing around doctrinal reasons that someone should get a final judgment.

If they want to brief collateral estoppel or law of the case, they are obviously welcome to do so, they didn't in the motion that they filed to your Honor. To cavalierly throw out doctrinal terms like that I think is inappropriate. They can't get the benefit of those doctrines, but if they think they can, they have an obligation to put that in writing before your Honor so we can properly join the issues.

It is not something that you can just toss out and say, oh, because of law of the case, now we can modify the Rule 54(b). That is not appropriate.

THE COURT: Okay, all right. I have learned a lot, I appreciate it, and I am going to allow everybody to have that additional briefing because these are complex issues. I wanted to further understand the contours of your position, so if I was going to ask for briefing I knew what to ask for so that it made clear and didn't cause confusion. I am sure that I can craft an order based on what I have heard today that will make sense to you about what I would like.

I would need to look more closely at what the generics

have filed. I have not had a chance to review that. I know the distributors have said, and retailers, that they plan on filing something on Monday, so it may be that I am dovetailing with what already has been done or what anticipates being done. No doubt, I think that you all should have the opportunity to brief these relatively complex civil procedure issues, and certainly I would benefit from it so that I could attempt to get the answer correct.

Thank you muchly and I appreciate it. I think that takes care of topics one and seven.

Let's move on to -- let's see. We are going to move off of topic two because everyone is in agreement it doesn't need to be addressed.

Topic three, which is the process for addressing any filed PI cases alleging non-designated cancers, so, if we could have those who are handling that case. Okay, for the record, everybody state your appearances for the record for purposes of Pauline getting that down.

MR. GILBERT: May it please the Court, Robert Gilbert on behalf of the Plaintiffs.

MR. BAYMAN: Andrew Bayman on behalf of the brand Defendants, also as counsel for Boehringer Ingelheim.

MS. ZOUSMER: Julia Zousmer, counsel for Boehringer Ingelheim and on behalf of the brand Defendants and Patheon.

THE COURT: Okay. This was how the MDL gets finalized

with respect to individual cases remaining with non-designated cancers. I framed the issue back on January 5th that we didn't know exactly how many non-designated cancers there were, but I had sampled some to confirm that cases do remain in the MDL that allege non-designated cancers and we know we have pro se litigants who brought non-designated cancers, and the Court had inquired, how do we handle this?

You have forwarded a joint proposed PTO which I have that, in essence, calls for a proposal for a 60-day deadline and a 120-day deadline. For the first deadline a non-designated cancer must file a notice indicating he or she will pursue a non-designated cancer, identifying the cancer, and Plaintiff will provide a general causation report.

For the second deadline, the expert must be produced, the expert report must be produced. These deadlines seem to apply to the cases in the MDL now and would apply to cases that continue to come in when the new cases arise.

So, the question the Court has is, is it contemplated that, for example -- if, for example, there are a hundred non-designated cancer cases, and only one files the notice of intent to pursue general causation for their non-designated cancer, does that mean the 99 cases -- other 99 cases would be subject to dismissal, that counsel for the one non-designated cancer does not -- not that they represent, but does not stand in any kind of a role to be bringing his notice of intent to

pursue general causation to represent the other 99?

For example, I analogize it to how leadership has handled this case, and I know there has been a comment by Mr. Gilbert back at the January 5th status conference when you said, "Your Honor, Robert Gilbert. That is not how things are contemplated to proceed. Plaintiffs' leadership made the decision not to pursue the non-designated cancers as part of this MDL. This order would apply to those non-designated cancers that are on file on an individual basis, so that if a particular lawyer or law firms have filed non-designated cancer cases, that they would be under an individual obligation to come forward with their experts if they choose to pursue their non-designated cancers, as we call them, as part of the MDL. This is not a responsibility of Plaintiff's leadership."

So, there hasn't been a ruling one way or another. The order appointing leaders didn't distinguish with this kind of a detail. It's clear that leadership made a decision to pursue certain cancers, the designated cancers, and not others, the non-designated cancers.

So, is it the position of everyone that the non-designated cancer cases are kind of like on their own without leaders to litigate their individual cases individually? One doesn't benefit from the other's work such as, in this case to date, where so many others benefited from the work of leadership in bringing forth all of the work

leadership has done up and to including Daubert.

I just want to make sure I understand that, and do you have a list of all cases that remain with non-designated cancers broken out by cancer?

So, let me hear from Plaintiffs first.

MR. GILBERT: Thank you, your Honor. May it please the Court, Robert Gilbert on behalf of the Plaintiffs.

First the easy question -- answer to the easy question, your last one, do we have a list of the non-designated cancer cases that are on file? Yours truly does not. I don't know whether the Defense does. Ms. Zousmer will capably answer that question, I am sure.

Let me perhaps fill in a little bit of the background about the proposed order that was submitted to your Honor.

During our post -- during our pre January 5th conferences, we had contemplated an order that included all sorts of deadlines, more than the two that are set forth in this proposed order, including deadlines to complete expert depositions, deadlines to file Daubert motions, deadlines to oppose Daubert motions, and the whole gamut of deadlines similar to the deadlines that apply to the designated cancer cases that just went through Daubert.

Following the January 5th conference, my friends on the other side, Ms. Zousmer and Mr. Bayman, suggested that perhaps we were taking one step too many right now and that this order that has been submitted to you, the form of which we have agreed to, would be the first step in the process, and this goes hand in hand with your question about leadership as well, so I am going to address it.

This order, if you adopt it and enter it, would give notice to those litigants, whether represented by counsel or pro se, who are alleging non-designated cancers that they now have 60 days from the date of this order — and we are talking about the ones on file already, there is provisions here for ones that are later filed — but 60 days from the date of your order to disclose a list of any non-designated cancers they intend to pursue through GC. It is as simple as that.

It doesn't require the disclosure of who their experts may be; it just requires them to step up to the plate and to tell the Court and to tell the Defendants whether they do intend to pursue an NDC, as we call it, so that — through general causation so that your Honor knows and Defense knows that they are going to do so.

If they do accomplish that step, this proposed order then gives them an additional 60 days thereafter to prepare and submit their expert reports on general causation with respect to the NDCs that they have identified. That would be the time when their experts are disclosed, their reports are disclosed, and following that, Ms. Zousmer and Mr. Bayman thought, and I agree, that it would be better to see how many, if any,

litigants asserting -- alleging NDCs actually come forward and comply with these deadlines.

We don't know whether there are going to be a handful, whether there are going to be any, or whether there will be dozens or hundreds. But once that time passes, the Court will be in a position to analyze it and determine whether there is a need for any Daubert briefing schedule at all on these NDC cancers, presuming perhaps that nobody has come forward. Maybe there has been one or a handful of people that have come forward and those few can work together.

Maybe there have been dozens or hundreds, and at that point the Court can say, look, I don't really want to have hundreds of individual people filing expert reports and briefs on NDC general causation. Let me ask these people that have satisfied the first two deadlines to submit a proposal to me for a leadership of that group.

But these are all things that may happen or may not happen, and my friends on the other side suggested, and we agreed, that it would perhaps be a little bit too much too quickly to throw all of these things into the first order, and instead, with this first order see what happens.

THE COURT: And if they don't comply with the first deadline of the notice, they will get dismissed?

MR. GILBERT: If they don't comply with the first deadline, the Defendants will bring that to the Court's

attention, and the Court will, I presume, either -- and I don't know which is the right move here. The Court will either enter an Order to Show Cause why your individual case should not be dismissed for failure to comply with this deadline or would immediately dismiss it.

I think the former would be a better procedural step than the latter, but that would be the case. If they didn't satisfy the first, or they satisfied the first, but not the second deadline, the Defendants would move — they would attach an appendix to their motion of those NDC cases where the litigants haven't complied with these two deadlines. They would ask for the Court to enter an order either dismissing them outright or enter an Order to Show Cause why they should not be dismissed.

or 30 days to show cause why you shouldn't be dismissed.

Probably most of them would not respond. Maybe one of them, and again we're talking in a hypothetical world, would come forward and say, I never received a copy of this order for the following reason, and the Court and/or the Defendants might change their position with respect to that single litigant if there was a credible good faith reason shown that your Order to Show Cause would not apply.

But the answer to your question is, yes, if the procedural posture was they didn't comply with these deadlines,

the first and/or the second, the Defendants would move and the Court would act accordingly.

THE COURT: Okay.

MR. GILBERT: Before I turn it over, I just want to address was your final question about leadership.

The leadership team that the Court appointed was asked to make decisions about how to proceed in this MDL and which cancers to pursue through the general causation phase. Without recounting the history, the chronological history of how those decisions were made, the Court is aware that over time Plaintiffs' appointed leadership ultimately made the final decision to pursue five designated cancers, and we memorialized those decisions with filings to the Court that are part of the record.

In so doing we made it clear that appointed leadership did not intend in this MDL to pursue the non -- NDCs through general causation. Your Court appointed leadership still is of that same view in this MDL, and so, if there are litigants, and apparently there are, whether they are pro se or represented by counsel, who wish to do this they need to comply with your order, if you choose to adopt the form of the one that we have submitted with Ms. Zousmer and Mr. Bayman on behalf of the Defendants, and they need to do so through their chosen individual counsel or pro se.

Again, as I said earlier, if so many of them come in

that the Court feels is part of the Court's case management duties, you feel that there needs to be a streamlined process involving many of them, the Court can then solicit the input from those who have complied about who they wish will lead their team, but it would not be the current Court appointed leadership.

THE COURT: Okay, thank you. From the Defense.

MS. ZOUSMER: Julia Zousmer on behalf of brand

Defendants. With respect to the question about what would
happen to Plaintiffs who don't meet the requirements of the
current order, the order that we submitted and agreed upon
contemplates that those individuals would be dismissed with
prejudice under Rule 41(b).

I understand Defendants would have to bring that motion, but because these were filed by Plaintiffs, and they have been, some of them, for years, we weren't contemplating a show cause process. It was these are the requirements; if you don't meet the requirements you will be dismissed with prejudice. That was the process that we had in mind and had agreed on.

With respect to the other issues that Mr. Gilbert discussed about the two -- why we took out the subsequent deadlines from this order, I agree with him completely. What he represented is exactly right. We thought that doing this would make a lot of sense so we could see is anyone going to

proceed with a non-designated cancer; and if so, how many people are going to proceed with non-designated cancers and how many non-designated cancers are they going to proceed with, and how many law firms are involved.

So, at that point the Court would be able to assess the lay of the land and decide whether appointing leadership would make sense. If there is one non-designated cancer case that meets this first 60-day deadline and discloses the intent to move forward with his or her case, there would be no need for leadership.

If there are cases across every non-designated cancer type and multiple firms and Plaintiffs involved, we would think that leadership would make a lot of sense, but of course that would be at the Court's discretion, and we would expect at least some sort of informal coordination from the Plaintiffs with the same types of — moving forward with the same types of cancer if it were not a formal leadership appointment from your Honor.

THE COURT: Okay. All right. I don't think I have any more questions. So, what you submitted is what you all have agreed to.

MS. ZOUSMER: Yes.

MR. GILBERT: Yes, your Honor.

THE COURT: Thanks so much. We'll move on to the next topic, topic five, which is maintaining the MDL to address any

transferred cases, any remand motions or other open items. We have kind of discussed it a bit, but there is one avenue of inquiry I haven't made yet.

If we could have counsel state their appearance for the record.

MR. GILBERT: Once again Robert Gilbert on behalf of the Plaintiffs.

MR. AGNESHWAR: Anand Agneshwar on behalf of Defendants. Good morning, your Honor.

THE COURT: Good morning. I know we have talked a lot about cases filed before a final judgment is entered and I know there is a disagreement between the Plaintiffs and the Defendants as to pre December 6 and post December 6 cases, which we will get sorted out.

Let's move forward to the date when the Court finally does enter a final judgment, whether it is as to brands only, whether it's some variation of everything we have spoken about. Based on your experience with MDLs, after the final judgment is entered what should be the posture of the MDL? Should the MDL be getting no more cases?

You know, we can communicate with the JPML about not transferring cases any more, but what if people direct file, what do we do about cases coming in after the judgment. I don't think I have any more questions about pre file judgment because we have covered that ground.

MR. GILBERT: Would you like me to address that first, your Honor?

THE COURT: Yes.

MR. GILBERT: Robert Gilbert on behalf of the Plaintiffs.

Mr. Agneshwar and I had good discussions. I think as a principal matter, we both agree at a high level that once you enter final judgments on the pending issues, on the Daubert ruling and the summary judgment, and however the other issues sort out, and those appeals ensue, this MDL does remain open during the pendency of this appeal, and is not technically closed or finished.

I think that the general view is that in MDLs where this occurs, and it is infrequent, the MDL itself remains open if for no other reason, as we just finished discussing on the prior topic, it has to remain open to deal with the NDCs, for example.

You raised an interesting point and that really -which Mr. Agneshwar and I did not discuss, and that relates to
future cases filed outside of the district that would be tagged
for transfer typically to the MDL. I don't have a set view on
that today, but clearly your Honor, as the transferee judge,
has the ability to communicate to the panel that if it is, for
example, future designated cancer cases from multitude of
districts -- I think there are 90 now around the country --

that those should -- that they should simply stay in their home transferor districts and be litigated there.

I am not taking a position that they should or they shouldn't, I think that is within your discretion, but it is something that you can confer with the panel about, which would reduce the number of new cases being transferred into the MDL insofar as they relate to designated cancer cases.

I hope that addresses your question.

THE COURT: Yes, sort of.

MR. GILBERT: Well, is there -- do you want me to elaborate a little?

make it here, whether they -- you know, the JPML sends them here, the question is, they land here -- I was trying to think about what should happen to them, and I wonder if the Plaintiffs' position is the same position you have with respect to your post December 6 cases, which is due process, they have the right to be heard, so devise some procedure, Order to Show Cause or why the Court's prior final judgment shouldn't -- something similar shouldn't be entered as to you, because you are alleging exactly what the pre December 6 Plaintiffs alleged and summary judgment was granted against them.

MR. GILBERT: If you are done --

THE COURT: Yes.

MR. GILBERT: -- yes. The answer is, we would rest on

the position we took with regard to post December 6 filings. Whether they are filed in this district or elsewhere and transferred to this district, our position is post December 6 filings by designated cancer Plaintiffs are entitled to due process through whatever procedural mechanism the Court designs. So, if they make their way here, that would ensue.

THE COURT: If they don't make their way here, and I were to somehow reach out to the JPML and say, don't send them any more, and they would go to — in their own transferor district, the transferor district wouldn't have the benefit of all the MDL work in his or her case, so that could also present a problem insofar as it would be inconsistent with the intent of an MDL, I would think.

MR. GILBERT: The answer is yes, but. You are a hundred percent correct in that regard, but if the Defendants' position is that the December 6 Daubert order should apply to any designated cancer case, whether filed prior to December 6 or thereafter, they could as easily move for entry of summary judgment in the transferor district if it is remanded there as they could move here.

Obviously the transferor judge would not have the knowledge and benefit of the workup that you have been privy to, but they could — the Defendants could still make the same motion there, in that transferor district, as they could make before you.

THE COURT: Okay. And from the Defense.

MR. AGNESHWAR: Your Honor, Anand Agneshwar representing Sanofi Defendants, but speaking on behalf of the brand Defendants.

On this last question, I don't think the time has come to let transferor Courts kind of make their own decisions in individual Federal cases that are filed or cases that get removed. I think the MDL's work is done when the appeal is all exhausted and we come back and we've had a hearing for efficiency that applies to all Federal cases. That is the typical approach that is taken by other MDL judges in similar cases.

As to the pre and post December 6th cases that are filed, I have two answers. Number one, I think you have to distinguish between, as Ms. Zousmer said earlier, claimants that were on the registry, but then choose to file their cases after December 6th.

Whether it is before judgment is entered or later, I think those individuals are bound, and that is clear not just because of PTO 72 that Ms. Zousmer referenced, but also because of the common benefit order PTO that the Court entered, that is PTO 37, that expressly has a condition of by being on the registry and getting the benefits of the registry they accede to leaderships' decision about negotiating PTOs and litigating PTOs and agree to be bound by them.

I think those cases are just -- there might be something procedural that has to happen, but they don't get the chance to do any kind of a do-over.

I do understand Mr. Keller's argument about, let's say a case is filed that has never been on the registry in — take Florida State Court for example, and we removed the case to Federal Court and it comes here, say, in June of next year — June of this year — we are in 2023 now, I keep having to remind myself about that — in June 2023, and the issue is what about that person.

I would say, your Honor, as the first answer, I think that because leadership has already litigated that exact issue, and that is what leadership is tasked with, before and after doesn't really matter and they should be bound as well.

I take Mr. Keller's point that as a technical matter, they didn't get the opportunity to say, oh, you should make this argument or make that argument. So, in that situation probably an Order to Show Cause process, giving 30 days to say why they have something different to say is probably the appropriate path.

THE COURT: Okay. All right. Yes. You are on mute.

MR. GILBERT: Thank you, your Honor.

MR. AGNESHWAR: I don't have anything more, your Honor. Oh, Mr. Gilbert does.

MR. GILBERT: I didn't contemplate there would be

argument on this particular issue -- in your question I didn't contemplate you were inviting argument on the issue of the legal impact of the Daubert order on registry claimants who may file versus those who file anew for the first time.

Just for the record, we do not agree with Mr.

Agneshwar's comments. It is our position that each new filer, whether filing for the first time never having been on the registry, or coming off of the registry and filing, are entitled to the same due process rights.

The amended PTO 37, PTO 72, we have no doubt in our mind what your eventual ruling may be, but we don't believe that those orders in and of themselves deprive new litigants for the first time, newly filed cases for the first time — we don't believe that they bind them under a ruling under Rule 56 or a Daubert ruling and they must be handled procedurally in the proper way going forward.

THE COURT: Okay. All right. Thank you very much.

I think that concludes everything. I know there were a couple of other topics before, but I don't think I need to hear anything further on the other topics. I appreciate counsel being ready to -- well, actually, I had decided that if you wanted to say something, I guess that was -- let's see what the other topics were.

I didn't have any other questions, that is what I meant to say. Let's see here. We just did topic five. Topic

six, we have already had the hearing. We did topic seven.

I didn't have any questions on topic eight or topic nine, but if anyone wanted to say something on topic eight or topic nine, you could because I know you had speakers lined up, but I don't have any questions.

MR. GILBERT: Your Honor, may I be heard for just a
moment?

THE COURT: Yes.

MR. GILBERT: Robert Gilbert on behalf of the Plaintiffs, may it please the Court.

I wasn't able to attend the hearing that you held last week on the motion for multi-party complaints because I was ill. I know it was a lengthy hearing and you invited us to refile a renewed motion, and it was refiled on Tuesday, and you then entered an order expediting the Defendants' response due in today by 5:00 p.m.

For the record, your Honor, we are prepared to waive our opportunity to file a reply and ask that the Court please expedite a ruling on this issue. The days are quickly passing and the ruling is the most important thing that we need. So, for that reason we are willing to waive our reply and the opportunity to have further argument.

THE COURT: Okay, I appreciate that. I don't think I have seen the response yet. Let me just see. Probably Defense knows.

MR. GILBERT: Unless it came in during our CMC today, it was not filed by the time we started. They have until 5:00 p.m. per your order.

THE COURT: All right. I will say this, I appreciate that it is urgent and that is why we have been handling it this way.

I will assume there will be no reply unless for some reason the response comes in and I feel I need one, but we'll leave it that no reply will come in and that you have waived your right.

I will say that regardless of how the Court rules on the motion, I will have to get a PTO out, which we will have to address procedurally how all of this is done regardless of the outcome. And I have started to alert our Clerk of Court as to the different permutations of what we might expect to see over the next days, weeks, and months, but I will work expeditiously on that as well.

Just so you know, there is a pretrial order that will have to be entered regardless of the ruling that sets out the procedures for how all this is going to be done vis-a-vis the logistics of handling it.

MR. GILBERT: Thank you, your Honor, and to the extent that the ruling obviously permits multi-Plaintiff complaint filing, we stand ready to assist, if the Court needs it, with helping to draft or offer comments on a PTO if that is going to

be the route that the Court ultimately chooses to go.

THE COURT: All right. Fair enough. Thank you.

That does conclude the status conference. There were no other questions or comments that I had. I am going to memorialize what kind of briefing I would like on sort of the obvious issues that came up today, which we all agree are complex civil procedure issues, and I think everybody pretty much has suggested they want to be heard in further briefing, and I think that is a good idea.

Why don't the distributors hold off on whatever you are going to file on Monday. I haven't looked at what the generics have filed, but my order may overlap whatever it is you have put in, what you have submitted. I don't even know if you have done it on the record or it was emailed. I am not sure.

I am going to issue an order that will come out today, or tomorrow at the latest, that will outline the best I can what I have gleaned about the discrete legal issues that I would like briefing on, and I will set out a briefing schedule. I think we have time because pretty much everyone agrees that we still have this process in place between now and at least April with respect to potential claimants coming in to meet their Statute of Limitations.

I will try to get the briefing and orders out in a timely way, but I think it is important that I hear more from

1 you on the law and your precise positions and the bases for 2 your positions on these various issues with respect to the pre 3 and post December 6, the brand versus nonbrand, final judgments, and things of that nature. 4 5 So, expect an order out today or tomorrow, and 6 distributors and retailers, hold off on your anticipated filing 7 for Monday so that we can make sure that your filing is 8 consistent with what the Court would like to hear. 9 Thank you again for your time. I know this has been 10 relatively long, but very, very helpful to the Court in 11 thinking about the next stages of the MDL. Have a good rest of 12 the day and a good upcoming weekend. 13 Thank you so much, take care. 14 (Thereupon, the hearing was concluded.) 15 16 I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript 17 from the record of proceedings in the above matter. 18 19 Date: 20 /s/ Pauline A. Stipes, Official Federal Reporter 21 Signature of Court Reporter 22 23 24 25

Pauline A. Stipes, Official Federal Reporter

```
6
                              20004 [1] 2/6
                                                            60 [3]
                                                                   53/8 53/10 53/20
 MR. AGNESHWAR: [3] 59/7
                              202-624-2500 [1] 2/6
 63/1 64/22
                                                            60-day [2] 50/9 58/8
                              2021 [4] 37/22 38/10 38/16
 MR. BAYMAN: [3] 4/1 44/20
                                                            60606 [1]
                                                                      1/18
                               38/23
                                                            60654 [1] 1/25
 49/20
                              2023 [5] 1/5 6/10 14/22 64/8
                                                            6333 [1] 1/25
 MR. GILBERT: [20] 3/23 18/9
                               64/9
                                                            6th [8] 19/9 23/3 23/6 26/7
 49/18 52/5 54/23 56/3 58/22
                              212-836-8011 [1]
                                               2/3
 59/5 59/25 60/3 61/9 61/22
                                                             28/17 29/10 63/13 63/17
                              213-896-2400 [1]
                                               2/9
 61/24 62/13 64/21 64/24 66/5
                              23-CB-80054 [1]
                                               44/4
 66/8 66/25 67/21
                              23-CV-80054 [1]
                                              14/21
 MR. KAPLAN: [5] 4/9 41/16
                                                            72 [4]
                                                                    30/25 31/6 63/20
                              24 [1] 13/20
 42/14 44/1 44/17
                                                             65/10
                              2400 [1] 2/9
                                                            7270 [1] 1/15
 MR. KELLER: [14]
                  20/21
                              250 [1] 2/2
 22/20 23/4 24/20 25/20 25/25
                                                            78 [1] 38/25
                              2500 [1] 2/6
 27/18 28/5 31/25 33/18 35/4
                              27 [1]
                                     9/11
 40/3 45/17 46/4
                                       1/14
                              2800 [1]
 MR. YOO: [8] 4/7 29/21 30/7
                                                            80054 [2]
                                                                      14/21 44/4
                              2924 [1]
                                       3/3
 35/22 39/13 40/8 40/19 40/23
                                                            8011 [1]
                                                                     2/3
                              2nd [1]
                                      8/12
 MS. MAGUIRE: [1]
                  4/11
                                                            8th [1] 2/8
 MS. ZOUSMER: [8]
                  4/5 27/8
 27/11 28/7 30/23 49/22 57/7
                              30 [2] 55/16 64/18
 58/21
                                                            90 [1] 60/25
                              30309 [1] 1/22
 THE COURT: [51] 2/13 4/13
                                                            90071 [1] 2/9
                              305-384-7270 [1]
                                                1/15
                                                            99 [3] 50/22 50/22 51/1
 20/20 22/9 22/22 23/17 25/13
                              31 [1] 12/21
 25/24 27/7 27/10 27/12 27/19
                              312-741-5222 [1]
                                                1/19
 28/6 29/12 30/3 30/8 31/7
                              312-995-6333 [1]
                                                1/25
 33/13 35/2 35/6 39/9 40/4
                                                            a view [1]
                                                                        35/13
                              33134 [1] 1/15
                                                            ability [3] 17/3 38/20 60/23
 40/17 40/21 41/13 42/12
                              3434 [1] 2/13
 43/25 44/12 44/18 45/13
                                                            able [5] 34/12 42/3 43/12
                              353 [1] 1/24
 45/20 48/16 49/24 54/21 56/2
                                                             58/5 66/11
                              37 [3] 30/15 63/22 65/10
 57/6 58/18 58/23 59/9 60/2
                                                            about [50] 4/5 5/6 5/24 6/10
                                                             9/2 10/16 10/20 13/16 15/17
 61/8 61/11 61/23 62/6 62/25
 64/20 65/16 66/7 66/22 67/3
                                                             17/24 18/23 21/9 23/17 24/14
                              400 [1] 2/8
 68/1
                                                             24/20 24/22 27/4 27/16 28/14
                              404-572-4600 [1] 1/22
                                                             29/16 30/13 34/14 35/19
                              41 [1] 57/13
                                                             36/25 44/19 45/2 45/3 47/11
                              4270 [1]
                                       1/18
                                                             48/24 52/14 53/3 53/9 56/5
'21 [1]
         40/10
                              4595 [1]
                                        37/17
                                                             56/7 57/4 57/9 57/22 59/11
                              4600 [1]
                                       1/22
                                                             59/17 59/21 59/23 59/24 61/5
                              4664 [1]
                                        40/21
        69/20
                                                             61/15 63/24 64/4 64/9 64/10
/s [1]
                              5
                                                             68/18 69/11
                                                            above [1] 69/17
                              50 [1] 39/23
1,100 [2] 6/16 8/23
                                                            absolutely [2] 36/3 36/23
                              50,000 [1] 9/16
1001 [1] 2/5
                                                            accede [1] 63/23
                              5222 [1] 1/19
10019 [1] 2/2
                                                            accomplish [1] 53/19
                              54 [27] 13/7 13/19 32/7 32/9
1100 [1] 1/14
                                                            accordingly [2] 14/10 56/2
                               32/15 32/21 32/24 33/19
1180 [1] 1/21
                                                            account [1] 47/9
                               34/11 37/23 39/11 39/15 40/2
12 [2] 9/8 9/9
                                                            accurate [1] 28/5
                               40/7 40/8 42/22 43/11 45/17
120-day [1] 50/10
                                                            across [2] 45/7 58/11
                               45/25 46/1 46/3 46/4 46/8
                                                            act [2] 30/19 56/2
12th [1] 1/24
                               46/11 46/24 47/21 48/16
13 [2] 14/22 44/14
                                                            acting [1] 36/16
                              55th [1] 2/2
13th [1] 42/11
                                                            action [11] 24/25 25/1 25/7
                              56 [3] 33/8 47/8 65/14
                                                             25/23 25/25 26/10 26/11
14 [1] 6/23
                              561-803-3434 [1] 2/13
                                                             26/16 26/19 38/19 38/23
14-day [1] 7/3
                              58 [22] 5/15 13/19 13/20
1407 [1] 26/8
                                                            actions [6] 15/20 22/6 26/6
                               14/5 14/10 15/4 15/12 23/23
150 [1] 1/17
                                                             32/3 38/3 39/7
                               32/4 39/5 39/12 39/13 40/6
1600 [1] 1/21
                                                            active [1] 16/13
                               40/7 40/7 43/3 45/16 45/19
18 [5] 5/23 15/4 15/20 23/22
                                                            actual [1] 34/23
                               46/2 46/4 46/23 47/21
                                                            actually [4] 12/16 46/14
31/18
                              5:00 [1] 67/2
18th [2] 6/13 18/24
                                                             54/1 65/21
                              5:00 p.m [1] 66/16
       1/5 26/16
                                                            add [5] 13/23 14/16 29/19
19 [2]
                              5th [22] 3/5 3/11 5/4 6/11
                                                             34/3 35/18
                               12/13 12/23 13/8 18/21 18/21
                                                            added [2] 25/19 44/14
                               19/25 19/25 20/4 24/13 24/14
20 [2]
       30/22 55/15
                                                            addition [3] 37/7 38/25
                               24/21 28/14 29/9 43/15 50/2
20 million nanograms [1]
                                                             45/16
                               51/4 52/15 52/23
 34/13
                                                            additional [5] 13/23 37/9
                                                             38/4 48/19 53/20
20-md-02924-ROSENBERG [1]
```

1/3

```
alleging [5] 6/14 49/15 53/7
                                                             49/14 50/25 53/11 53/25 54/4
Α
                              54/1 61/21
                                                             54/7 58/20 58/25 59/1 59/22
Additionally [1] 38/24
                              allow [1] 48/18
                                                             59/24 62/9 62/17 64/3 65/24
             7/2 18/3 18/5
address [15]
                              allowed [1] 42/22
                                                             66/2 66/5
18/12 18/13 18/15 19/11 32/1
                                                            anybody [2] 29/19 31/17
                              allows [1] 42/5
41/4 43/22 53/4 56/5 58/25
                              almost [8] 11/12 16/7 16/10
                                                            anyone [5] 7/1 28/1 35/16
60/1 67/13
                                                             57/25 66/3
                               17/7 22/19 34/22 45/21 46/12
addressed [1] 49/13
                                                            anything [8] 20/25 23/17
                              along [1] 4/4
addresses [1] 61/8
                              already [17] 9/3 16/20 22/4
                                                             27/17 29/19 35/18 44/19
addressing [4] 3/25 4/21
                               24/15 24/25 25/3 26/8 26/24
                                                             64/23 65/20
17/16 49/14
                               32/7 33/5 39/15 40/15 46/24
                                                            anyway [1] 19/16
adds [1] 33/4
                                                            anywhere [1] 8/22
                               49/4 53/9 64/12 66/1
adequately [1]
               17/19
                              also [15] 4/3 12/10 20/5
                                                            apparent [1]
                                                                         10/6
adjudicate [1]
               32/10
                               28/12 28/24 34/5 37/17 37/22
                                                            apparently [2] 33/2 56/19
adjudicated [2] 26/24 34/8
                               38/3 40/16 43/6 47/10 49/22
                                                            appeal [16] 5/16 37/21 38/2
adjudication [1] 12/15
                               62/11 63/20
                                                             38/12 43/11 45/16 45/17
admittedly [1] 23/7
                                                9/5 10/4
                                                             45/19 45/25 46/1 46/1 46/2
                              Alternatively [2]
adopt [2] 53/5 56/21
                              although [4] 6/8 11/17 14/12
                                                             46/4 46/4 60/11 63/8
advanced [1] 35/25
                                                            appeals [4] 16/5 16/6 43/17
                               35/13
adverse [1] 15/16
                                         3/18 20/23
                                                             60/10
                              always [2]
afford [1]
           27/25
                              am [39]
                                       3/14 4/17 4/18 5/7
                                                            appearance [3] 3/16 3/21
after [26]
           7/3 7/16 7/19
                               5/7 5/8 5/9 6/1 7/9 8/15
                                                             59/4
 7/19 8/16 8/18 8/20 9/20
                               12/6 15/19 18/11 18/12 18/22
                                                            appearances [1]
14/19 19/9 20/3 20/16 22/3
                               19/16 21/9 24/23 25/21 26/22
                                                            appellate [2]
                                                                          46/3 47/23
25/15 28/12 28/17 28/19
                               29/20 29/23 31/20 32/1 33/14
                                                            appendix [8]
                                                                         6/20 8/23 8/23
 28/24 34/20 37/7 39/15 40/25
                               41/4 41/11 45/18 45/24 48/3
                                                             8/24 10/11 19/2 19/8 55/10
59/18 59/23 63/17 64/13
                               48/18 48/22 49/3 52/12 53/4
                                                            applicability [2] 30/2 41/22
again [9] 15/6 31/19 32/2
                                                                             5/1 7/23
                               61/3 68/4 68/14 68/16
                                                            application [9]
35/19 41/17 55/18 56/25 59/6
                                         13/23 14/2 14/13
                                                             12/10 30/6 36/5 40/13 41/8
                              amend [13]
69/9
                               14/15 15/8 15/9 33/3 38/18
                                                             42/17 43/1
against [15] 14/9 14/16 22/2
                                                            applies [8] 17/10 29/9 29/10
                               38/24 39/2 42/23 46/9 46/10
27/3 34/4 34/9 34/12 34/19
                                                             31/10 36/23 44/25 47/3 63/10
                                          11/18 11/20
                              amended [11]
34/22 34/24 38/19 43/8 46/25
                               14/23 15/25 26/13 33/4 38/22
                                                            apply [22] 10/2 16/13 17/9
47/6 61/22
                               41/7 41/10 44/3 65/10
                                                             21/8 22/1 24/8 24/10 24/24
AGNESHWAR [5] 2/1 59/8 60/6
                              amending [2] 26/15 31/19
                                                             24/24 25/2 28/24 40/16 42/8
60/19 63/2
                              amendment [1] 14/16
                                                             43/13 43/19 45/7 50/16 50/16
Agneshwar's [1] 65/6
                              amendments [1] 11/19
                                                             51/8 52/21 55/23 62/16
agree [10] 20/14 24/17 28/9
                              among [1] 31/14
                                                            apply, [1] 48/4
37/14 53/25 57/23 60/7 63/25
                              amount [1]
                                                            apply, but [1]
                                                                           48/4
                                         37/5
65/5 68/6
                              analogize [1] 51/2
                                                            applying [1]
                                                                         43/18
agreed [10] 9/3 17/25 19/16
                              analysis [1] 37/18
                                                            appointed [5] 56/6 56/11
19/19 26/18 53/2 54/19 57/11
                                                             56/15 56/17 57/5
                              analyze [2] 41/5 54/6
57/20 58/21
                                                            appointing [2] 51/16 58/6
                              ANAND [3] 2/1 59/8 63/2
agreeing [1] 30/17
                              and we [1]
                                         63/9
                                                            appointment [1] 58/17
agreement [5] 6/12 29/15
                                         55/20 56/1
                                                            appreciate [8] 9/21 17/17
                              and/or [2]
41/22 42/3 49/12
                              ANDREW [7]
                                         1/20 2/4 4/2 4/10
                                                             19/10 48/18 49/9 65/20 66/23
agrees [2] 30/18 68/20
                               41/17 44/21 49/21
                                                             67/4
ahead [1] 27/2
                              anew [1] 65/4
                                                            approach [1] 63/11
alert [1] 67/14
                              Angeles [1]
                                          2/9
                                                            appropriate [3] 6/9 48/16
alive [12] 15/5 15/5 15/14
                                          11/13 46/2 51/15
                              another [3]
                                                             64/20
15/24 16/8 16/10 17/8 17/8
                              answer [13]
                                          7/7 23/16 24/2
                                                            appropriately [1] 47/5
17/13 31/16 32/4 44/15
                               24/23 26/4 35/21 49/8 52/8
                                                            approximately [1]
                                                                              6/15
all [65] 3/1 3/15 3/20 4/15
                               52/12 55/24 61/25 62/14
                                                            April [4] 6/10 8/18 24/10
5/18 6/18 9/15 9/19 10/19
                               64/11
                                                             68/22
11/4 11/12 12/8 15/6 15/23
                              answered [1] 47/10
                                                            April 5 [1] 6/10
17/7 17/7 18/15 18/16 19/15
                              answers [2] 17/17 63/14
                                                            are [131]
19/20 20/24 21/9 21/18 24/15
                              anticipated [3] 42/7 43/1
                                                            are entitled [1] 62/4
28/16 28/17 32/4 32/10 32/10
                               69/6
                                                            area [1] 13/1
32/24 36/3 36/16 37/12 37/20
                                                            aren't [3] 17/7 31/16 32/6
                              anticipates [1] 49/4
37/23 39/4 43/7 43/8 43/20
                              any [58] 7/13 8/2 8/10 11/19
                                                            argue [1] 15/20
 43/23 45/5 45/11 46/8 47/12
                               12/19 14/16 19/5 19/7 19/21
                                                            argued [1] 24/15
 47/19 48/17 49/5 51/25 52/3
                               21/1 21/3 21/6 21/8 21/10
                                                            arguing [1] 12/9
 52/16 54/7 54/17 54/20 58/19
                               22/19 22/25 23/15 23/20
                                                            argument [7] 21/17 64/4
 58/20 62/11 63/8 63/10 64/21
                               26/21 27/6 28/18 28/20 28/21
                                                             64/17 64/17 65/1 65/2 66/22
 65/17 67/4 67/13 67/20 68/2
                               29/4 29/13 31/21 31/23 33/4
                                                            arguments [2] 21/13 45/11
 68/6
                               33/12 33/25 35/17 36/12
                                                            arise [1]
                                                                      50/17
allege [2] 38/19 50/5
                               36/23 36/24 37/24 38/12 39/5
                                                            Arnold [1]
                                                                       2/1
alleged [1] 61/21
                               40/13 40/15 40/16 43/23
                                                            around [2]
                                                                       48/5 60/25
```

39/11 46/10 46/17 47/5 48/15 31/23 33/23 34/7 35/13 35/15 Α 48/19 49/12 57/15 59/25 35/18 43/6 44/20 44/21 47/12 as [115] 47/14 47/22 59/16 61/20 63/20 63/20 64/12 66/4 **ASHLEY [5]** 1/16 3/25 18/11 **brands' [1]** 9/1 66/12 68/20 20/22 32/2 **brief [3]** 20/6 48/7 49/6 **become** [1] 8/23 **ask [13]** 3/13 9/6 14/20 **becoming** [1] 26/2 **briefing [13]** 8/7 8/8 42/9 22/10 25/18 37/1 40/3 43/15 been [44] 8/3 8/13 12/20 42/11 43/22 48/19 48/21 54/7 48/21 48/21 54/14 55/12 15/12 16/11 18/22 18/25 19/5 68/5 68/8 68/19 68/19 68/24 66/18 19/6 19/7 23/6 23/7 23/21 **briefly [1]** 18/12 **asked [7]** 4/21 12/19 31/13 24/12 25/4 25/19 31/17 32/7 **briefs** [1] 54/13 33/9 33/11 33/24 56/6 33/5 34/12 35/3 37/21 38/7 bring [3] 38/22 54/25 57/14 **asking [2]** 10/19 32/22 38/12 40/11 44/5 44/9 44/22 **bringing [2]** 50/25 51/25 **asserted [2]** 44/10 44/11 44/23 45/9 45/10 45/11 49/4 broadly [1] 30/19 asserting [1] 54/1 51/3 51/15 53/1 54/9 54/11 **broken [1]** 52/4 **assess** [1] 58/5 57/16 62/22 64/5 65/7 67/5 brought [5] 12/20 25/17 67/24 assist [1] 69/9 25/23 28/2 50/6 **assume** [2] 9/14 67/7 1/9 5/6 7/22 before [26] **burden [1]** 6/23 **assuming** [1] 27/2 7/22 10/20 11/23 18/21 19/25 **Atlanta [1]** 1/22 21/18 25/10 25/19 26/15 attach [1] 55/9 27/10 27/16 28/12 29/5 37/6 CA [1] 2/9 attachment [1] 5/18 40/7 41/14 48/12 56/4 59/11 call [2] 51/13 53/16 **attempt** [1] 49/7 62/25 63/18 64/13 65/19 called [1] 31/5 **attend** [1] 66/11 calls [1] 50/9 began [1] 3/6 attention [1] 55/17/18 7/25 8/19 19/9 **behalf** [22] 3/24 4/6 4/11 came [7] **attorney [2]** 12/16 23/10 4/13 18/11 26/24 29/24 30/20 24/12 67/1 68/6 attorney/client [1] 35/17 36/16 41/18 49/20 can [37] 3/23 10/16 10/19 attorneys [1] 3/13 49/21 49/24 52/7 56/22 57/8 11/20 15/8 15/8 16/17 17/10 authorization [1] 30/21 17/13 17/15 18/15 21/23 24/3 59/6 59/8 60/4 63/3 66/9 authorized [1] 30/18 25/10 27/1 27/14 32/11 32/17 behind [2] 10/15 18/2 automatic [1] 33/7 32/25 33/20 35/15 45/15 46/9 being [12] 10/12 24/6 26/7 automatically [3] 25/12 26/7 28/9 31/20 31/21 44/14 46/9 46/23 48/12 48/13 48/14 25/18 28/3 49/4 61/6 63/22 65/21 48/15 48/22 54/10 54/12 57/3 avail [4] 16/17 16/23 17/11 **belief [1]** 15/15 59/21 61/5 68/17 69/7 17/15 **believe [8]** 3/9 9/23 27/25 can't [3] 23/16 33/8 48/11 **availed** [2] 33/3 34/3 28/12 40/14 43/7 65/11 65/14 cancer [26] 6/5 7/11 11/11 **avenue** [3] 2/5 17/14 59/2 17/3 17/4 39/3 45/6 50/11 **believes** [1] 15/6 38/4 await [1] bellwether [1] 36/6 50/12 50/12 50/20 50/22 **aware [6]** 12/16 22/15 22/23 benefit [10] 10/19 18/3 35/1 50/24 51/10 51/21 52/4 52/10 23/4 35/11 56/10 48/2 48/11 49/7 51/23 62/10 52/21 58/1 58/7 58/11 58/17 62/22 63/21 60/24 61/7 62/4 62/17 **benefited** [1] 51/24 **cancer does [1]** 50/24 back [12] 4/16 5/3 7/7 30/12 cancers [32] 4/25 6/15 6/19 **benefits** [1] 63/23 35/15 37/15 38/16 41/14 best [2] 24/3 68/17 9/1 16/13 19/18 19/19 24/8 45/14 50/2 51/4 63/9 **better [3]** 43/22 53/25 55/6 29/1 31/22 36/19 36/22 37/13 background [1] 52/13 **between [16]** 7/13 8/3 8/11 49/15 50/2 50/3 50/5 50/6 **barely [1]** 15/14 9/22 12/4 15/23 27/15 27/21 51/7 51/9 51/13 51/18 51/18 Barker [2] 14/23 44/5 27/22 29/15 29/17 29/17 51/19 52/4 53/7 53/11 54/8 base [1] 22/15 46/14 59/12 63/15 68/21 56/8 56/12 58/2 58/3 **based [9]** 7/23 9/14 17/21 **BI [1]** 4/3 **candid** [1] 23/5 26/9 31/14 39/1 45/12 48/23 **big** [1] 15/22 cannot [2] 16/23 17/11 59/18 **bind [2]** 16/14 65/14 capably [1] 52/12 **bases** [1] 69/1 bit [8] 6/2 17/21 18/5 23/18 care [3] 13/4 49/10 69/13 23/14 51/9 basis [2] 23/20 52/13 54/19 59/2 **carefully [1]** 37/15 **baton** [1] 20/24 **board** [1] 45/7 Cartee [4] 15/19 15/20 32/19 **BAYMAN [9]** 1/20 4/2 4/7 **Boehringer** [3] 4/6 49/22 32/21 18/18 44/21 49/21 52/24 case [52] 1/3 5/22 6/24 6/25 49/23 53/24 56/22 7/4 8/11 14/21 15/4 16/8 borrowing [1] 24/4be [160] 16/10 16/10 16/21 21/4 23/21 **both** [5] 18/21 19/25 41/20 be treated [1] 28/21 43/22 60/7 23/23 24/7 25/14 25/20 26/2 **BEACH [3]** 1/2 1/5 2/13 27/7 28/14 28/21 28/22 29/9 Boulevard [1] 1/14Beach/Ft [1] 2/13 34/18 36/14 39/2 39/3 40/15 **bound [6]** 28/3 28/17 31/3 **Bear** [1] 30/9 63/19 63/25 64/14 40/16 44/12 44/17 45/22 46/1 **beast** [1] 23/10 46/1 46/13 48/1 48/5 48/8 **box** [1] 31/5 **because [38]** 3/18 5/7 6/20 48/15 49/16 51/3 51/24 55/3 boxes [1] 11/13 9/6 10/6 12/2 15/6 16/22 brand [13] 4/3 4/7 14/24 55/7 57/1 58/7 58/9 62/11 19/13 23/10 24/23 25/12 26/1 16/25 18/7 18/25 19/25 26/19 62/17 64/5 64/6 27/25 28/21 28/25 29/10 49/21 49/24 57/8 63/4 69/3 case's [1] 16/20 30/10 34/10 34/17 38/4 38/15 brands [16] 11/8 16/22 17/2 cases [109]

```
С
                38/6
categories [1]
causation [25]
               5/25 16/12
16/18 16/25 17/1 17/9 17/10
17/15 29/2 34/6 34/6 36/9
36/19 36/22 37/4 37/12 42/17
 50/13 50/21 51/1 53/17 53/21
54/14 56/8 56/17
cause [16] 17/3 21/24 21/25
24/5 27/24 38/19 38/23 48/22
 55/3 55/13 55/15 55/16 55/23
57/17 61/19 64/18
causes [1] 45/6
cavalierly [1] 48/9
CB [1] 44/4
certain [6] 15/22 18/18 23/9
32/13 36/11 51/18
certainly [1] 49/7
certification [7] 13/7 30/13
30/14 30/23 30/24 33/20
37/23
certified [11] 28/17 28/21
31/2 32/16 32/20 32/24 33/5
34/11 35/1 46/11 46/24
certify [5] 31/1 32/23 42/21
43/11 69/16
chance [3] 24/16 49/1 64/3
change [2] 21/11 55/21
            47/7
changed [1]
checked [1] 11/13
checking [1] 31/5
Cheffo [1] 9/6
Chicago [2] 1/18 1/25
choose [4] 29/1 51/12 56/21
63/16
chooses [1] 68/1
chosen [1] 56/23
chronological [1]
                   56/9
circle [1] 35/15
Circuit [6] 15/17 16/9 31/14
32/20 46/20 47/20
civil [6] 24/25 25/2 27/7
35/25 49/6 68/7
claim [13] 12/17 12/20 17/4
33/4 33/6 33/25 34/4 34/12
34/21 44/5 44/10 44/10 47/6
claimant [2] 30/18 36/24
claimants [12] 8/16 9/11
9/11 9/24 12/5 30/15 30/16
31/6 36/17 63/15 65/3 68/22
claims [24] 9/16 9/19 13/5
13/24 14/8 14/16 15/22 15/24
21/18 32/10 32/13 32/15
32/18 32/24 33/20 34/19
34/25 41/1 43/8 45/5 46/11
46/13 46/19 46/24
clarify [1] 45/18
Clark [1]
          1/24
class [3] 22/14 38/3 39/7
clean [1] 47/22
clear [10] 18/17 30/1 30/22
31/8 36/3 45/15 48/22 51/17
56/15 63/19
clearly [2] 44/25 60/22
Clerk [8] 5/21 7/4 11/2 11/3
11/7 11/24 11/25 67/14
client [1] 23/10
```

```
clients [2] 21/8 23/13
close [2] 6/12 43/7
closed [1] 60/12
closely [2] 37/17 48/25
CMC [3] 18/21 18/22 67/1
collateral [3] 36/13 48/1
48/7
colleagues [1] 18/18
combination [1] 16/3
combine [1] 3/15
come [21] 8/5 8/9 8/20 23/3
23/11 23/23 25/13 37/11 42/3
 50/17 51/12 54/1 54/8 54/9
 55/18 56/25 61/12 63/5 63/9
67/9 68/16
comes [2]
         64/7 67/8
coming [13] 8/3 8/5 8/10
8/13 9/11 9/20 11/5 17/19
24/7 40/17 59/23 65/8 68/22
            9/6 39/10 51/3
comment [3]
comments [9] 29/24 31/9 44/6
 44/7 45/2 45/12 65/6 67/25
68/4
common [1] 63/21
communicate [2] 59/21 60/23
communications [1]
                   23/13
compiled [1] 19/2
complaint [14] 9/10 12/16
14/23 26/14 33/3 33/4 33/15
34/2 38/18 38/22 39/3 41/3
44/4 67/23
complaints [21] 8/6 9/13
11/12 11/14 11/18 11/20
12/15 12/22 13/5 14/13 14/15
15/9 15/11 15/18 15/25 16/3
31/16 33/17 33/18 34/23
66/12
complaints with [1] 14/15
complete [2] 42/11 52/18
completely [4] 10/15 34/22
46/12 57/23
complex [3] 48/19 49/6 68/7
complexity [2] 39/22 43/21
complicated [1] 37/14
complied [2] 55/11 57/4
comply [6] 54/2 54/22 54/24
55/4 55/25 56/20
concept [1] 24/2
conclude [1] 68/3
concluded [1] 69/14
concludes [1] 65/18
concur [1]
          18/19
condition [1] 63/22
conditional [1] 46/16
confer [5] 12/14 18/1 19/24
20/8 61/5
conference [11] 1/9 3/4 3/5
3/13 12/23 17/20 35/11 48/5
51/4 52/23 68/3
conferences [1] 52/16
conferred [2] 20/3 42/2
confers [3] 19/6 19/12 20/1
confirm [1] 50/4
confirmation [1] 12/18
confusion [1] 48/22
connection [1]
              7/6
consent [1] 30/16
consider [6] 10/16 16/5
```

```
consideration [1] 38/8
considered [2] 25/3 47/7
considering [3] 7/10 23/25
35/20
consistent [2] 3/12 69/8
consolidated [4] 7/14 7/16
16/11 26/8
contained [1] 12/22
contemplate [4] 12/7 21/20
64/25 65/2
contemplated [8] 8/17 9/18
 31/21 31/22 42/1 50/18 51/6
 52/16
contemplates [2] 6/22 57/12
contemplates that [1] 6/22
contemplating [3] 8/25 9/18
57/16
context [4] 24/19 26/1 26/5
 35/20
continue [5] 8/5 8/13 8/20
 22/14 50/17
continuing [1]
               40/12
contours [1]
             48/20
conversation [1]
                 20/12
conversations [2]
                  18/20 19/1
convey [1] 41/20
coordinate [1] 41/19
coordination [1] 58/15
copy [2] 5/22 55/19
correct [7] 30/8 32/6 40/9
44/13 49/8 62/15 69/16
correction [1]
               7/3
could [28] 3/13 3/19 6/20
 9/24 11/18 14/4 14/8 14/20
 26/4 32/20 34/1 37/9 38/18
 42/8 45/18 47/6 48/1 49/7
 49/15 57/25 59/4 62/11 62/18
 62/20 62/23 62/23 62/24 66/4
counsel [20] 4/3 4/3 6/23
10/9 10/11 15/15 20/1 21/17
 22/13 29/13 29/16 30/18
 49/22 49/23 50/23 53/6 56/20
56/24 59/4 65/21
counsel being [1] 65/21
count [5] 42/20 42/21 42/24
43/2 43/4
country [1] 60/25
counts [2] 43/10 43/14
couple [2]
           42/18 65/19
course [5] 23/8 25/8 39/19
46/17 58/13
COURT [113]
Court's [41] 5/16 5/25 8/2
10/22 10/24 11/21 13/7 13/18
 14/6 15/21 16/2 16/11 16/14
 16/18 16/19 16/25 17/1 17/6
 17/8 17/9 17/15 19/4 19/21
 26/9 28/3 28/18 29/5 30/2
 30/7 31/3 36/21 37/15 38/25
 39/1 41/6 42/4 42/25 54/25
 57/1 58/14 61/19
courtroom [1] 22/3
Courts [1] 63/6
covered [2] 38/10 59/25
craft [1] 48/23
create [2] 6/21 12/7
credible [1] 55/22
```

21/18 23/1 41/12 47/12

```
C
critical [1] 22/7
Crowell [1] 2/5
crux [1] 13/3
cuff [2] 24/24 48/4
current [3] 39/5 57/5 57/11
cv [1] 14/21
D
       2/6
D.C [1]
data [1] 37/9
date [14]
          3/7 6/9 6/9 7/15
11/14 21/7 22/7 40/25 41/2
51/24 53/8 53/10 59/15 69/19
Daubert [37] 5/1 7/15 7/23
12/11 16/22 19/4 19/22 22/18
27/1 28/19 28/24 29/5 30/2
31/10 32/25 35/2 36/4 36/4
36/4 36/20 37/12 39/1 41/9
41/22 42/17 43/1 47/24 48/3
52/1 52/19 52/20 52/22 54/7
60/8 62/16 65/3 65/15
day [8] 7/3 11/15 14/14
22/15 50/9 50/10 58/8 69/12
days [8] 6/23 53/8 53/10
53/20 55/16 64/18 66/19
67/16
de [1] 1/14
dead [6] 15/21 15/23 15/23
15/23 32/4 34/22
deadline [14] 8/18 11/19
14/12 14/20 38/24 50/9 50/10
50/10 50/14 54/23 54/25 55/4
55/9 58/8
deadlines [13] 36/7 50/15
52/17 52/18 52/19 52/19
52/20 52/21 54/2 54/15 55/11
55/25 57/23
deal [1] 60/16
December [50] 7/14 7/16 7/19
7/22 8/1 8/1 8/12 8/12 8/20
9/21 10/2 10/3 10/5 10/7
10/12 12/5 12/5 19/9 23/3
23/6 24/13 24/14 24/21 26/7
27/15 27/15 27/22 27/23
27/23 28/2 28/12 28/12 28/14
28/17 28/24 29/7 29/9 29/10
29/18 59/13 59/13 61/17
61/21 62/1 62/3 62/16 62/17
63/13 63/17 69/3
December 5 [1] 29/7
December 5th [5] 24/13 24/14
24/21 28/14 29/9
December 6 [31] 7/14 7/16
7/19 7/22 8/20 9/21 10/2
10/3 10/5 10/7 10/12 12/5
12/5 27/15 27/15 27/23 27/23
28/2 28/12 28/12 28/24 29/18
59/13 59/13 61/17 61/21 62/1
62/3 62/16 62/17 69/3
December 6th [7] 19/9 23/3
23/6 26/7 28/17 29/10 63/13
December 7 [1] 8/1
December 8 [1]
               8/1
decide [1] 58/6
decided [4] 10/25 36/18 40/2
```

```
decision [10] 21/25 26/9
27/2 33/1 47/24 48/3 51/7
 51/17 56/12 63/24
decisions [6] 22/4 32/12
56/7 56/10 56/13 63/6
declined [5] 14/4 14/10 38/3
38/15 42/21
defendant [5] 14/16 15/10
25/17 36/24 45/4
DEFENDANTS [48] 1/20 4/3 4/7
 4/11 4/13 5/20 6/7 11/10
 11/13 11/15 11/16 13/21
 13/22 14/1 14/1 14/6 14/9
 14/11 16/17 17/14 18/4 18/25
 19/2 22/2 25/7 26/19 26/20
 27/9 27/14 41/9 41/18 41/23
 44/14 49/22 49/24 53/15
 54/25 55/9 55/20 56/1 56/23
 57/9 57/14 59/9 59/13 62/23
 63/3 63/4
Defendants be [1]
                  11/10
Defendants' [5]
                16/5 18/6
 20/1 62/15 66/15
Defense [11] 23/19 29/13
 29/15 30/12 35/7 35/12 52/11
 53/17 57/7 63/1 66/24
defer [2] 39/7 39/18
delay [3] 8/15 32/14 47/11
delving [1] 30/5
           38/1
denied [1]
deny [1] 46/6
denying [1]
            13/18
depends [1]
            33/19
depositions [1] 52/19
deprive [1] 65/12
desert [1]
           34/4
designated [51] 4/25 6/4
6/14 6/18 7/11 9/1 11/11
 16/13 17/4 19/17 19/19 24/7
 24/8 29/1 31/22 36/18 36/22
 37/13 39/3 49/15 50/1 50/3
 50/5 50/6 50/11 50/12 50/20
 50/21 50/23 51/7 51/8 51/10
 51/13 51/18 51/19 51/21 52/3
 52/10 52/21 53/7 53/11 56/12
 58/1 58/2 58/3 58/7 58/11
60/24 61/7 62/4 62/17
designs [1] 62/6
desired [1] 20/2
detail [2] 42/15 51/17
determinations [1] 38/5
determine [1] 54/6
determined [1] 38/4
develop [1] 46/7
developed [1] 25/5
devise [1] 61/18
did [17] 4/17 10/5 11/23
20/4 20/14 22/18 24/16 29/13
56/16 60/19 65/25 66/1
didn't [21] 12/7 21/16 32/21
34/17 35/2 37/12 39/12 44/7
 44/24 47/4 48/8 48/22 50/2
 51/16 55/7 55/25 64/16 64/25 district [16] 1/1 1/1 1/10
65/1 65/24 66/2
difference [5] 8/3 8/11
15/23 21/3 27/15
differences [1] 22/13
```

```
different [5] 26/1 26/5
                             34/14 64/19 67/15
                             differently [4] 3/20 10/5
                             10/10 10/13
                             difficult [1]
                                           6/21
                            direct [9] 8/4 8/11 8/21
                             10/1 21/2 22/8 23/3 27/21
                              59/22
                             directed [4] 5/21 7/4 31/10
                             36/8
                             directing [1]
                                           11/2
                             directly [4] 19/8 19/14 21/4
                             23/13
                            directs [1] 11/7
                             disagree [4] 20/13 27/1 34/5
                              47/17
                             disagreement [2] 13/1 59/12
                             disappointing [1]
                                               20/7
                                          53/11
                             disclose [1]
                             disclosed [2]
                                           53/23 53/23
                             discloses [1]
                                           58/8
                             disclosure [1]
                                            53/13
                                          34/17 36/7
                             discovery [5]
                             37/5 47/2 47/5
                            discrete [1]
                                          68/18
                             discretion [3] 47/13 58/14
                             61/4
                             discuss [2] 3/6 60/19
                             discussed [8] 3/11 13/9
                             19/13 19/13 42/2 43/15 57/22
                             59/2
                             discussing [2] 13/13 60/15
                             discussion [6] 19/5 38/9
                             39/18 42/6 45/7 47/16
                             discussions [5] 17/24 18/20
                             44/23 45/10 60/6
                             disingenuous [1]
                                              37/2
                             dismiss [6] 15/10 16/6 25/15
                             25/16 26/20 55/5
                            dismissal [2] 32/12 50/23
                             dismissed [10] 32/19 37/6
                             37/7 47/6 54/23 55/4 55/14
                              55/16 57/12 57/18
                            dismissing [2] 15/22 55/12
                            dispositive [2] 36/8 36/10
                             dispute [2] 16/19 43/2
                             disputes [1] 47/15
                             disputing [1] 16/16
                             distinct [1] 24/13
                             distinction [19]
                                              7/13 7/18
                             7/20 9/5 9/22 9/23 12/4 12/6
                             19/10 21/3 21/5 27/21 27/22
                              28/10 28/11 28/13 28/15
                             29/16 29/17
                             distinguish [2] 51/16 63/15
                             distinguishable [1] 32/19
                             distributor [4] 4/11 13/14
                             14/9 41/18
31/12 32/23 33/16 40/6 43/10 distributors [16] 5/2 12/11
                             12/23 13/8 14/17 14/25 20/11
                              31/25 33/11 33/24 34/24
                             42/18 46/15 49/2 68/10 69/6
                             distributors' [1] 46/22
                             11/24 13/11 13/12 15/21 16/1
                              42/7 60/20 62/2 62/3 62/10
                              62/10 62/19 62/24
                             districts [2] 60/25 61/2
```

D	45/17 56/25 63/15	<pre>everything [6] 10/20 31/15</pre>
	easily [1] 62/18	34/20 36/7 59/17 65/18
diverting [1] 5/7		
	easy [2] 52/8 52/8	evidence [2] 36/22 37/13
dividing [1] 22/7	effective [1] 41/2	<pre>evidentiary [2] 34/8 34/9</pre>
DIVISION [1] 1/2		
	efficiency [1] 63/10	exact [1] 64/12
do [38] 4/18 9/23 10/22 13/4	efficient [1] 21/23	exactly [4] 46/6 50/3 57/24
14/20 21/7 21/19 22/15 23/16		_
	eight [2] 66/2 66/3	61/21
23/20 24/8 25/6 25/22 25/23	either [5] 18/2 33/20 55/1	example [24] 10/10 14/7
26/24 27/22 33/5 39/13 39/14		
	55/2 55/12	14/18 14/21 15/1 21/11 21/20
40/18 47/13 48/8 50/4 50/7	elaborate [1] 61/11	24/21 28/13 29/7 33/2 34/2
52/2 52/9 53/15 53/18 53/19		
56/20 56/23 59/23 59/23	Eleventh [6] 15/17 16/9	34/4 34/9 44/3 44/14 44/16
	31/14 32/20 46/20 47/19	47/4 50/19 50/19 51/2 60/17
61/10 64/3 64/3 64/4 65/5		
do-over [1] 64/3	else [6] 8/22 27/25 29/19	60/24 64/6
	31/15 35/17 44/19	except [2] 23/22 33/9
docket [8] 5/17 14/22 23/7		_
26/13 36/15 37/17 40/21 44/4	else's [3] 25/23 26/2 26/11	exception [1] 15/3
	elsewhere [1] 62/2	exchange [1] 12/7
docketing [1] 12/1		
doctrinal [2] 48/6 48/10	emailed [1] 68/14	exchanged [1] 19/7
	emails [1] 19/7	exclusion [1] 16/22
doctrines [2] 48/3 48/11		= =
Dodge [1] 3/9	empowered [2] 29/1 29/11	Excuse [1] 5/7
	end [1] 22/6	exhausted [1] 63/9
does [17] 7/13 7/18 11/1	ends [2] 6/9 46/2	exhibit [5] 5/18 5/23 5/23
11/25 12/19 14/13 16/18		
	enough [2] 5/5 68/2	26/17 30/15
35/12 50/22 50/24 50/24	ensue [2] 60/10 62/6	expect [3] 58/14 67/15 69/5
52/10 52/11 59/16 60/10		
	<pre>enter [25] 5/22 6/3 7/4 7/11</pre>	expedite [1] 66/19
64/24 68/3	11/2 11/7 11/24 11/25 13/6	expediting [1] 66/15
doesn't [12] 7/20 7/21 7/25		
	14/5 14/10 15/16 27/3 33/8	expeditiously [1] 67/16
16/11 16/14 16/21 17/8 24/5	38/3 38/14 38/15 43/13 43/16	experience [11 59/18
49/12 51/23 53/13 64/14		
dog [1] 44/24	53/5 55/2 55/12 55/13 59/16	experiences [1] 24/4
	60/8	expert [5] 50/14 50/15 52/18
doing [4] 24/3 24/17 56/15		53/21 54/13
57/24	entered [34] 5/11 5/13 5/17	
	6/7 6/23 8/19 10/25 13/20	experts [8] 29/2 34/14 34/16
don't [52] 3/18 7/7 10/14	15/13 23/21 23/24 24/6 24/10	37/1 37/3 51/12 53/13 53/23
12/6 13/5 18/1 19/15 21/3		
21/10 23/5 23/10 23/15 23/17	25/16 31/17 31/22 32/7 32/7	explanation [1] 10/11
	37/18 37/20 37/22 39/11	explicitly [1] 43/13
24/17 24/23 26/4 26/14 26/21		
27/3 32/10 34/9 35/14 35/16	40/10 40/16 45/1 46/2 55/15	expressed [1] 10/6
	59/11 59/19 61/20 63/18	expressly [2] 7/13 63/22
36/6 45/3 45/19 46/17 47/10		
48/4 52/11 54/3 54/12 54/22	63/21 66/15 67/19	extent [4] 4/20 29/24 30/20
	<pre>entering [2] 9/1 39/13</pre>	67/22
54/24 55/1 57/10 57/18 58/19	entitled [3] 47/15 62/4 65/9	ovtra [1] 47/24
59/24 60/21 62/7 62/8 63/5		
64/2 64/23 65/11 65/14 65/19	entries [1] 23/7	eyes [1] 5/7
	entry [17] 7/22 10/22 10/24	
66/5 66/23 68/10 68/13		F
done [11] 14/19 31/20 43/5	11/11 13/9 13/19 14/22 26/13	
	37/16 37/17 38/1 39/8 39/23	fact [6] 6/12 10/14 11/18
49/4 49/4 52/1 61/23 63/8		
67/13 67/20 68/14	40/21 42/24 47/11 62/18	25/3 31/18 43/21
	equally [1] 31/22	factual [1] 25/4
doubt [3] 26/21 49/5 65/10	error [2] 7/1 7/3	failure [1] 55/4
dovetailing [1] 49/3		
	errors [1] 6/20	fair [2] 22/4 68/2
dovetails [2] 12/9 23/18	ESQ [7] 1/12 1/16 1/20 1/23	fairly [1] 6/17
down [4] 17/21 20/24 47/22		faith [1] 55/22
49/18	2/1 2/4 2/7	
	essence [2] 6/17 50/9	familiar [1] 48/3
dozens [2] 54/5 54/11	essentially [3] 13/10 42/16	far [1] 29/16
draft [1] 67/25		
	43/16	favor [3] 11/1 11/8 14/10
draw [1] 7/13	establish [1] 22/22	February [1] 42/11
drawing [2] 12/4 19/11		
drilled [1] 17/21	estopped [1] 31/4	February 13th [1] 42/11
	estoppel [3] 36/13 48/1 48/7	Federal [6] 5/16 31/2 63/7
drugs [1] 37/2		
due [14] 6/19 21/12 22/1	eve [2] 20/5 20/9	63/10 64/7 69/20
	even [6] 23/6 25/16 32/12	feedback [1] 17/23
22/8 24/1 24/12 27/5 27/5	37/7 46/23 68/13	feel [4] 17/18 38/14 57/2
27/25 46/17 61/17 62/4 65/9		
66/15	eventual [1] 65/11	67/8
UU/IU	[-] 00/ 11	•
		feels [1] 57/1
during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10	feels [1] 57/1
during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22
during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22
during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2</pre>	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2</pre>	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2</pre> E	<pre>every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11 everybody [10] 3/16 3/23</pre>	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10 fight [2] 27/3 44/24
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2</pre> E	every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11 everybody [10] 3/16 3/23 4/21 8/25 18/7 22/12 23/22	<pre>felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10 fight [2] 27/3 44/24 figure [1] 18/5</pre>
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2 E each [5] 3/20 5/22 7/4 30/17</pre>	<pre>every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11 everybody [10] 3/16 3/23</pre>	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10 fight [2] 27/3 44/24 figure [1] 18/5 file [22] 9/12 9/13 9/14
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2 E each [5] 3/20 5/22 7/4 30/17 65/6</pre>	<pre>every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11 everybody [10] 3/16 3/23 4/21 8/25 18/7 22/12 23/22 48/18 49/17 68/7</pre>	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10 fight [2] 27/3 44/24 figure [1] 18/5 file [22] 9/12 9/13 9/14
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2 E each [5] 3/20 5/22 7/4 30/17</pre>	<pre>every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11 everybody [10] 3/16 3/23 4/21 8/25 18/7 22/12 23/22 48/18 49/17 68/7 everyone [5] 3/1 4/14 49/12</pre>	felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10 fight [2] 27/3 44/24 figure [1] 18/5 file [22] 9/12 9/13 9/14 21/15 22/8 26/14 37/24 42/3
<pre>during [6] 19/5 20/8 52/15 52/15 60/11 67/1 duties [1] 57/2 E each [5] 3/20 5/22 7/4 30/17 65/6</pre>	<pre>every [17] 15/4 16/7 16/10 16/10 16/20 17/4 21/12 24/24 25/1 26/9 34/11 34/21 34/21 36/23 36/23 47/6 58/11 everybody [10] 3/16 3/23 4/21 8/25 18/7 22/12 23/22 48/18 49/17 68/7</pre>	<pre>felt [3] 37/8 39/19 39/22 Ferguson [1] 1/13 few [3] 15/3 15/5 54/10 fight [2] 27/3 44/24 figure [1] 18/5 file [22] 9/12 9/13 9/14</pre>

```
38/18 38/22 39/3 41/3 44/4
                                                             59/6 60/4 64/24 66/9
F
                               53/1 56/21
                                                            give [6] 7/2 18/4 21/21
file... [9] 52/19 53/9 59/22
                              formal [1] 58/17
                                                             23/15 23/19 53/5
 59/24 63/16 65/4 65/4 66/18
                              formally [1] 21/15
                                                            given [5] 15/21 16/1 22/4
 68/11
                                                             39/22 43/21
                              former [1] 55/6
filed [58] 4/24 7/14 7/16
                              forth [5] 30/21 30/25 31/6
                                                            gives [1] 53/20
 8/4 8/12 8/16 8/21 9/20 10/1
                                                            giving [2] 34/20 64/18
                               51/25 52/17
 10/9 14/22 14/23 19/8 21/2
                              forthcoming [1] 13/14
                                                            gleaned [1] 68/18
 21/5 23/3 23/6 24/13 24/14
                                                            go [11] 3/19 3/21 5/6 10/14
                              forward [9] 51/12 54/1 54/8
 24/15 27/21 28/9 28/12 28/14
                               54/10 55/19 58/9 58/16 59/15
                                                             27/2 30/12 34/17 43/3 46/7
 28/21 28/21 28/24 29/9 29/10
                               65/16
                                                             62/9 68/1
 29/17 30/20 37/21 37/25 38/2
                              forwarded [2] 6/12 50/8
                                                            goal [1] 5/10
 38/12 38/13 40/15 40/17
                              found [3] 33/2 34/2 34/13
                                                            goes [3] 43/5 45/22 53/3
 40/25 41/3 42/11 47/8 48/9
                              framed [1]
                                         50/2
                                                            going [38] 3/14 4/17 4/18
 49/1 49/15 51/10 53/10 57/15
                              frankly [4] 17/24 20/2 36/11
                                                             5/3 8/19 9/19 18/12 19/11
 59/11 60/20 62/2 62/17 63/7
                               39/19
                                                             19/16 20/15 20/18 21/11
 63/14 64/5 65/13 67/2 68/12
                                                             26/22 27/2 30/5 30/6 31/2
                              friend [1]
                                         18/13
filed or [1] 27/21
                              friends [2] 52/23 54/18
                                                             31/4 31/9 42/13 47/18 47/23
filed that [1] 64/5
                                        25/23 44/7
                                                             48/18 48/21 49/11 53/4 53/18
                              front [2]
filer [1] 65/6
                                     2/13
                                                             54/3 54/4 57/25 58/2 58/3
                              Ft [1]
files [4] 21/20 26/16 27/6
                              full [10] 16/13 33/16 34/8
                                                             65/16 67/20 67/25 68/4 68/11
 50/20
                               34/9 34/17 35/3 36/15 41/5
                                                             68/16
filing [16] 11/4 20/6 20/15
                               41/21 47/5
                                                            gone [4] 32/25 37/15 46/12
 21/8 26/6 26/15 28/16 28/19
                              fully [3] 16/19 32/18 43/24
                                                             46/20
 46/21 49/3 54/13 65/7 65/8
                              fundamental [1] 20/13
                                                            good [15] 3/1 3/24 4/2 4/8
 67/24 69/6 69/7
                                                             4/10 4/12 4/14 41/17 55/22
                              further [7]
                                          8/8 31/23 35/5
filings [3] 56/13 62/1 62/4
                               48/20 65/20 66/22 68/8
                                                             59/9 59/10 60/6 68/9 69/11
fill [1] 52/13
                              future [6] 37/24 38/13 39/6
                                                             69/12
fills [1] 12/2
                               40/13 60/20 60/24
                                                            got [3] 23/22 46/3 46/5
final [78]
                                                            governed [1] 8/2
finalized [1] 49/25
                              G
                                                            grant [3] 9/16 26/22 33/25
finally [1] 59/15
                              GA [1] 1/22
                                                            granted [4] 16/6 39/5 40/2
find [1] 33/16
                              gamut [1] 52/20
                                                             61/22
finding [1] 36/21
                              gavel [2] 20/18 20/23
                                                            granting [1] 13/18
finished [3] 27/13 60/12
                              GC [1] 53/12
                                                            grapple [1] 11/17
60/15
                              Gelborn [1] 26/9
                                                            grappled [1] 35/24
firms [3] 51/10 58/4 58/12
                              general [29] 4/23 5/10 5/25
                                                            ground [1] 59/25
first [31] 3/19 7/17 10/19
                               16/12 16/18 17/1 17/9 17/10
                                                            grounds [4] 36/20 37/6 37/8
14/23 17/7 18/4 18/17 20/6
                               17/15 17/20 29/2 34/6 34/6
                                                             37/23
 28/16 30/11 36/3 43/3 50/10
                               36/9 36/19 36/22 37/4 37/12
                                                            group [2] 8/12 54/16
 52/5 52/8 53/2 54/15 54/20
                               41/22 42/17 50/13 50/21 51/1
                                                            groups [1] 41/20
 54/21 54/22 54/24 55/8 55/8
                               53/17 53/21 54/14 56/8 56/17
                                                            guess [2] 61/12 65/22
 56/1 58/8 60/1 64/11 65/4
                               60/13
                                                            guide [1] 22/16
 65/7 65/13 65/13
                              generally [1] 42/2
                                                            quides [1] 35/21
five [5] 40/20 40/22 56/12
                              generic [24] 5/19 13/22
58/25 65/25
                               13/25 14/24 15/3 34/13 34/15
fix [1] 6/23
                                                            had [45] 5/19 5/24 6/15 6/15
                               37/2 37/20 37/24 37/25 38/1
FL [3] 1/5 1/15 2/13
                               38/10 38/11 38/12 39/2 39/6
                                                             8/7 9/3 10/16 11/17 12/3
Floor [2] 1/24 2/8
                               39/24 40/1 40/6 40/14 40/15
                                                             12/16 14/1 15/17 18/20 19/24
FLORIDA [4] 1/1 11/25 42/7
                               40/17 40/25
                                                             20/11 24/15 25/14 25/19
64/6
                                                             26/13 29/6 31/1 34/2 34/21
                              generic's [1]
                                            46/21
focus [1] 12/3
                                                             36/1 36/9 37/21 38/2 38/7
                              generics [24] 4/9 12/12
fold [1] 17/6
                               14/17 20/2 29/22 29/24 31/24
                                                             38/12 43/24 44/11 44/24
folks [1] 36/1
                               33/10 33/13 33/24 34/10
                                                             45/10 49/1 50/4 50/6 52/16
follow [1] 21/1
                               34/24 35/24 37/5 37/9 38/7
                                                             57/19 57/19 60/6 63/9 65/21
follow-ups [1] 21/1
                               38/19 39/4 39/11 40/8 44/23
                                                             66/1 66/4 68/4
following [3] 52/23 53/24
                                                            hand [4] 21/17 40/19 53/3
                               47/3 48/25 68/12
55/20
                              get [21] 4/21 9/13 12/17
                                                             53/3
follows [1] 3/4
                                                            handful [2] 54/3 54/9
                               23/7 35/1 39/12 40/7 44/25
followup [1] 11/9
                               46/23 47/5 48/2 48/6 48/11
                                                            handle [1] 50/7
for BI [1] 4/3
                               49/8 54/23 59/14 63/7 64/2
                                                            handled [3] 3/12 51/3 65/15
force [1] 16/13
                               64/16 67/12 68/24
                                                            handling [3] 49/16 67/5
foregoing [1] 69/16
                              gets [2] 45/22 49/25
                                                             67/21
form [29] 11/10 11/12 11/14
                              getting [6] 8/15 13/3 39/15
                                                            happen [5] 54/17 54/18 57/10
11/18 11/20 11/23 12/15
                                                             61/15 64/2
                              49/18 59/20 63/23
 12/16 13/5 14/13 14/15 14/23
                              GILBERT [17] 1/12 1/13 3/25
                                                            happened [1] 14/18
 15/9 15/11 15/18 15/25 19/19
                               18/10 20/24 42/1 42/6 44/22
                                                            happens [1] 54/21
 27/23 31/16 33/18 34/2 34/23
                               49/19 51/4 51/5 52/7 57/21
                                                            happy [2] 29/20 32/1
```

н	Honor [71]
	Honor's [7] 4/5 9/15 28/19
harbor [1] 21/10	29/8 32/25 34/5 45/3
hard [1] 19/2	HONORABLE [1] 1/9
has [51] 3/9 10/14 10/22	hope [6] 2/8 12/8 16/1 17/18
10/25 11/19 12/20 14/12	18/15 61/8
15/10 15/12 16/10 18/25 19/5	hot [3] 34/4 44/10 44/16
21/6 21/12 24/25 25/1 25/4	hot truck [1] 44/10
25/6 25/9 25/18 26/8 26/10	how [32] 3/12 5/11 6/21 8/5
26/24 29/3 31/17 35/5 35/8	8/9 10/8 10/11 13/11 17/10
38/22 38/24 40/15 41/8 42/23	17/13 18/5 23/6 24/8 31/10
43/3 44/23 49/4 50/18 51/2	35/12 35/19 36/2 41/11 49/25
51/3 52/1 53/1 54/8 54/9	
60/16 60/23 63/5 63/22 64/2	50/3 50/7 51/2 51/5 53/25
64/5 64/12 68/8 69/9	56/7 56/9 58/1 58/2 58/4
hasn't [4] 23/21 33/5 33/9	67/11 67/13 67/20
51/15	however [2] 18/8 60/9
have [165]	hundred [2] 50/19 62/15
have certified [1] 32/20	hundreds [3] 54/5 54/11
have little [1] 16/1	54/13
haven't [7] 24/12 26/12	hypothetical [3] 26/23 34/16
33/11 45/10 55/11 59/3 68/11	55/18
having [6] 28/3 37/1 39/15	I
47/16 64/8 65/7	
he [8] 6/24 9/11 24/15 44/6	I also [1] 34/5
44/7 46/20 50/11 57/24	I'11 [2] 47/25 48/4 I'm [2] 18/17 20/18
head [1] 19/11	I'm [2] 18/17 20/18
hear [14] 3/23 7/17 15/7	idea [2] 39/14 68/9
18/3 27/14 30/11 30/11 35/16	identified [1] 53/22
41/14 41/15 52/5 65/20 68/25	<pre>identifying [1] 50/12</pre>
69/8	IL [2] 1/18 1/25
heard [23] 20/5 21/13 21/22	ill [1] 66/13
22/24 23/19 24/12 24/15	illusions [1] 21/10
	<pre>immediately [1] 55/5</pre>
25/18 27/9 28/4 29/14 31/12	impact [1] 65/3
33/10 35/3 35/12 36/4 41/16	important [4] 24/2 25/3
46/14 47/25 48/23 61/18 66/6	66/20 68/25
68/8	<pre>inappropriate [1] 48/10</pre>
hearing [21] 4/19 8/7 8/17	included [7] 5/18 6/15 8/23
9/7 9/8 9/9 12/8 12/13 13/8	9/24 10/7 10/8 52/16
17/17 17/19 17/22 18/7 20/5	including [4] 14/17 33/25
20/9 20/16 63/9 66/1 66/11	52/1 52/18
66/13 69/14	inconsistent [2] 46/22 62/12
held [4] 3/5 24/25 26/8	incorporate [1] 41/1
66/11	incorporated [1] 41/9
help [1] 43/25	independent [2] 12/17 44/10
helpful [4] 3/15 5/5 18/8	independently [1] 12/1
69/10	indicated [2] 20/14 30/3
helping [1] 67/25	indicating [2] 43/16 50/11
her [10] 21/16 22/1 25/1	indicative [3] 13/10 39/17
25/6 27/7 38/18 38/22 39/2	43/16
58/9 62/11	individual [36] 5/19 5/22
here [19] 3/2 3/3 3/4 19/14	6/23 8/9 10/9 10/21 11/13
21/17 23/17 24/9 37/18 45/6	12/20 12/21 13/21 14/3 15/4
53/9 55/2 61/13 61/14 61/14	15/10 15/15 15/17 15/18 16/4
62/6 62/7 62/20 64/7 65/25	16/8 16/14 16/20 17/7 22/12
high [1] 60/7	24/25 25/7 26/10 26/19 33/17
highlights [1] 28/14	41/2 50/1 51/9 51/11 51/22
him [3] 22/1 44/8 57/23	54/13 55/3 56/24 63/7
himself [1] 33/3	individually [1] 51/23
his [12] 21/16 25/1 25/6	individuals [2] 57/12 63/19
27/6 33/3 38/18 38/22 39/2	influence [1] 25/5
44/7 50/25 58/9 62/11	inform [2] 6/24 6/25
history [2] 56/9 56/9	informal [1] 58/15
hold [2] 68/10 69/6	informed [1] 43/24
holds [1] 16/9	infrequent [1] 60/14
Holland [1] 2/8	Ingelheim [3] 4/7 49/22
home [1] 61/1	49/24
HON [1] 2/12	•
	initially [1] 5/14

injury [1] 4/25 input [3] 16/24 36/1 57/3 inquired [1] 50/7 inquiry [1] 59/3 17/18 insight [1] 23/15 insofar [5] 6/18 15/15 22/12 61/7 62/12 instead [1] 54/21 intelligent [1] 23/17 intend [4] 42/3 53/12 53/16 56/16 49/25 intended [2] 19/21 44/16 intending [1] 12/6 intent [5] 10/15 50/21 50/25 58/8 62/12 interest [2] 4/15 4/19 interested [2] 13/16 41/13 interesting [2] 24/22 60/18 interim [1] 17/23 34/16 interject [1] 20/25 interrupt [1] 30/4 invited [1] 66/13 inviting [1] 65/2 involuntary [1] 26/3 involved [3] 45/9 58/4 58/12 **involving** [1] 57/3 is [238] is authorized [1] 30/18**isn't [2]** 6/25 23/21 **issue [28]** 9/10 10/17 10/22 12/10 17/16 20/7 20/13 20/16 25/10 27/10 27/14 29/12 30/11 33/6 35/4 35/14 41/19 42/25 43/12 44/20 44/24 50/2 64/9 64/12 65/1 65/2 66/19 68/16 **issued [3]** 7/15 22/4 47/21 issues [29] 5/5 10/21 18/3 18/14 20/20 22/17 25/19 26/23 35/24 36/2 36/11 37/12 37/14 39/9 39/23 43/21 45/3 47/13 47/24 48/13 48/19 49/6 57/21 60/8 60/9 68/6 68/7 68/18 69/2 it [128] it's [7] 13/19 14/21 34/6 34/24 40/24 51/17 59/17 items [1] 59/1 its [2] 31/4 47/4 itself [2] 34/3 60/14 J 3/9 Jamie [1] 8 16/4 **January [28]** 1/5 3/5 3/11 5/4 6/11 6/13 8/12 9/7 9/7 9/8 9/9 12/13 12/23 13/8 14/22 18/21 18/21 18/24 19/25 19/25 20/4 26/16 43/15 44/14 50/2 51/4 52/15 52/23 **January 12 [2]** 9/8 9/9 January 13 [2] 14/22 44/14 **January 18th [2]** 6/13 18/24 **January 19 [1]** 26/16 **January 5 [1]** 9/7 **January 5th [15]** 3/5 3/11 6/11 12/13 12/23 18/21 18/21 19/25 19/25 20/4 43/15 50/2

51/4 52/15 52/23

	T	T
J	knowledge [1] 62/22	limitation [1] 37/3
	known [1] 20/8	Limitations [1] 68/23
Johnston [1] 20/12	knows [3] 53/17 53/17 66/25	limited [2] 37/12 43/18
join [3] 39/21 46/21 48/13		
joinder [2] 26/3 26/4	Kopelowitz [1] 1/13	linchpin [2] 17/3 45/4
	-	line [1] 22/7
joined [7] 18/11 25/15 25/22	<u> </u>	lined [1] 66/4
25/22 25/25 26/7 26/10	lack [1] 16/4	list [15] 3/8 6/1 6/15 6/16
joining [1] 26/16		
joint [2] 6/13 50/8	laid [1] 31/15	6/20 6/21 6/24 6/25 7/1 7/5
jot [1] 20/24	land [2] 58/6 61/14	10/7 10/8 52/3 52/9 53/11
	landscape [3] 4/16 23/2	listed [4] 5/18 5/23 11/15
JPML [5] 21/4 22/8 59/21	23/24	19/8
61/13 62/8	language [2] 32/5 40/22	listen [2] 4/16 7/7
judge [3] 1/10 60/22 62/21		
judges [1] 63/11	larger [1] 8/24	listening [1] 12/9
	last [13] 3/13 4/17 6/3 8/17	litigant [2] 34/18 55/21
judgment [123]	9/7 17/20 17/22 20/6 36/25	litigants [6] 50/6 53/6 54/1
judgment independently [1]	43/15 52/9 63/5 66/11	55/11 56/18 65/12
12/1		
judgments [7] 4/24 5/15 15/4	late [2] 20/14 34/25	litigate [4] 29/3 29/6 29/11
32/6 32/16 60/8 69/4	later [3] 10/9 53/10 63/18	51/22
	latest [1] 68/17	litigated [3] 25/19 61/2
JULIA [6] 1/23 4/4 4/6 27/12	latter [1] 55/7	64/12
49/23 57/8	law [11] 17/11 28/1 28/1	
juncture [1] 22/19		litigating [1] 63/24
June [3] 64/7 64/8 64/9	36/14 43/23 48/1 48/7 48/15	litigation [4] 1/5 3/3 22/19
	51/10 58/4 69/1	36/5
June 2023 [1] 64/9	lawyer [1] 51/10	little [9] 6/2 16/1 17/21
jurisdiction [5] 13/6 13/11	lay [3] 4/18 41/11 58/6	18/4 23/18 23/20 52/13 54/19
16/5 31/4 43/3	laying [1] 4/15	61/11
jurisdictional [1] 43/12		
just [37] 4/7 4/16 7/7 9/14	lead [2] 30/18 57/4	live [2] 34/19 47/6
10/6 10/14 10/20 14/21 19/23	leader [1] 22/12	living [1] 16/13
	leaders [5] 22/15 22/18 23/8	LLC [1] 1/17
24/11 24/11 25/13 25/23	51/16 51/22	LLP [5] 1/21 1/24 2/1 2/5
27/11 29/14 32/14 33/8 35/11	leadership [29] 3/10 21/9	2/8
37/13 40/5 41/11 45/6 45/12		
47/23 48/14 52/2 52/22 53/14	22/10 22/11 22/14 28/25	local [1] 42/7
56/4 60/15 63/19 64/1 65/5	29/11 36/16 36/18 51/2 51/6	logistics [1] 67/21
	51/14 51/17 51/25 52/1 53/3	long [1] 69/10
65/25 66/6 66/24 67/18	54/16 56/5 56/6 56/11 56/15	longer [4] 32/17 32/25 38/20
V	56/17 57/6 58/6 58/10 58/13	46/13
K	58/17 64/12 64/13	look [10] 32/9 36/13 36/14
KAPLAN [7] 2/4 4/10 20/12		
20/14 39/18 41/18 46/15	leaderships' [1] 63/24	37/2 37/12 40/9 45/20 46/9
Kaplan's [1] 39/22	leading [1] 22/24	48/25 54/12
	learned [1] 48/17	looked [4] 36/11 37/15 37/17
Kaye [1] 2/1	least [12] 16/23 20/7 21/6	68/11
keep [3] 9/7 24/1 64/8	24/3 34/25 35/25 39/20 42/6	looking [3] 5/7 5/8 5/9
keeping [1] 23/8		1
KELLER [18] 1/16 1/17 3/25	46/15 46/19 58/15 68/21	Los [1] 2/9
18/11 18/13 19/11 20/19	leave [5] 14/20 15/9 31/19	lose [1] 25/12
	42/23 67/9	lost [1] 34/10
20/22 27/13 27/17 28/9 31/12	left [4] 5/8 10/10 20/2 33/1	lot [8] 17/18 18/14 36/1
32/2 41/15 41/24 42/6 44/9	legal [6] 25/4 35/14 35/20	45/12 48/17 57/25 58/13
45/14	43/20 65/3 68/18	59/10
Keller's [5] 36/25 39/10		JJ/ 10
44/6 64/4 64/15	length [1] 42/8	м
kept [1] 11/14	lengthy [1] 66/13	
	Lenkner [1] 1/17	M-P-I-C [1] 42/21
kind [12] 4/15 4/16 23/18	Leon [1] 1/14	made [15] 9/6 20/7 30/15
28/5 29/14 50/25 51/16 51/21	less [1] 15/21	32/15 45/11 45/12 46/4 46/12
59/2 63/6 64/3 68/5		
King [2] 1/21 1/24		48/22 51/6 51/17 56/10 56/11
knew [1] 48/21	22/10 40/5 52/5 52/13 54/14	56/15 59/3
	63/6 66/24	Maguire [1] 4/12
Knight [1] 2/8	let's [14] 9/14 24/10 24/11	maintaining [1] 58/25
know [45] 3/8 3/18 3/18 8/5		make [24] 19/12 21/12 25/21
10/9 10/12 12/4 12/9 12/13	49/11 49/11 59/15 64/4 65/22	
12/19 12/20 17/18 18/1 19/12		
19/15 22/6 22/13 23/6 24/1	65/25	47/25 48/23 52/2 56/7 57/25
24/1 24/3 26/14 31/16 35/9	level [1] 60/7	58/7 58/13 61/13 62/6 62/7
	LIABILITY [2] 1/5 3/2	62/23 62/24 63/6 64/16 64/17
40/18 40/19 44/6 45/19 49/1	like [19] 15/7 18/2 21/11	69/7
50/3 50/5 51/3 52/11 54/3	24/18 24/22 28/20 29/14	makes [1] 21/3
55/2 59/10 59/11 59/21 61/13	41/12 42/2 45/20 45/21 48/1	management [2] 48/5 57/1
65/18 66/4 66/13 67/18 68/13		=
69/9	48/10 48/24 51/21 60/1 68/5	mandate [2] 15/19 31/15
knowing [1] 17/20	68/19 69/8	manufactured [2] 17/2 47/4
knowing [1] 17/20	likely [1] 11/3	manufacturer [2] 5/20 13/25

```
mind [4] 21/11 41/8 57/19
M
                              65/11
                  14/24
manufacturers [2]
14/25
manufacturing [1] 13/22
many [17] 3/4 11/11 18/13
 20/19 23/6 26/14 26/14 39/20
 50/3 51/24 52/25 53/25 56/25
 57/3 58/1 58/3 58/4
Mart [1] 47/4
master [4] 3/9 12/22 17/23
 33/15
material [1] 19/14
matter [12] 3/2 7/18 7/20
 7/21 7/25 8/22 17/11 28/1
                              Monday [5]
 60/7 64/14 64/15 69/17
                               68/11 69/7
matters [2]
            4/4 9/5
                              months [2]
may [30] 4/23 6/9 11/15
 15/14 15/15 15/24 20/18
                              more [21]
 22/25 25/5 27/9 35/7 35/13
 37/4 38/13 39/21 40/4 41/13
 44/5 44/9 49/3 49/19 52/6
 53/14 54/17 54/17 65/3 65/11
 66/6 66/10 68/12
                              Moreover [1]
maybe [7] 7/8 10/14 12/6
 23/16 54/8 54/11 55/17
md [1]
       1/3
                               59/9 59/10
MDL [39] 3/3 5/17 7/14 8/2
14/4 15/5 16/8 16/11 16/11
 17/4 22/13 23/8 23/11 25/13
 25/14 28/25 29/5 29/11 30/20
45/5 49/25 50/4 50/16 51/8
 51/13 56/7 56/16 56/18 58/25
 59/19 59/19 60/10 60/14
 60/21 61/6 62/11 62/13 63/11
 69/11
MDL's [1] 63/8
MDLs [4] 21/24 24/4 59/18
60/13
me [19] 3/23 5/4 5/7 5/8 7/2
10/5 12/2 18/17 22/10 27/3
30/9 40/5 52/5 52/13 54/14
 54/15 60/1 61/10 66/24
mean [4] 25/17 25/22 25/23
 50/22
                               58/16
meaning [2] 7/20 14/19
means [1] 32/17
                               41/1 42/20
meant [2] 33/22 65/25
meatiest [1] 35/10
mechanically [1] 5/11
mechanism [1] 62/5
mechanisms [1] 42/19
meet [8] 19/6 19/12 19/24
20/1 20/8 57/10 57/18 68/22
meets [1] 58/8
memorialize [1] 68/5
memorialized [1] 56/12
mentioned [6] 38/17 42/1
                               64/24 65/5
43/14 44/3 44/22 47/2
merger [1] 33/16
                              36/14 63/20
merit [1] 36/12
messier [1] 47/18
met [2] 20/3 42/1
Miami [1] 1/15
middle [1] 40/24
might [7] 18/3 34/12 34/14
46/20 55/20 64/1 67/15
million [1] 34/13
                               69/13
```

multi [5] 8/6 8/10 9/10 minimum [1] 8/25 66/12 67/23 minute [2] 4/16 9/2 **multi-party** [1] 66/12 missed [2] 20/25 21/14 multi-Plaintiff [3] 8/6 9/10 misunderstanding [1] 44/6 67/23 **multiple [2]** 11/3 58/12 mix [1] 40/15 mixed [6] 37/23 37/24 40/1 **multitude** [1] 60/24 40/13 40/16 40/25 must [4] 50/11 50/14 50/15 **modified** [1] 47/21 65/15 **modify** [1] 48/15 **must file [1]** 50/11 **mute [1]** 64/21 **molecule** [1] 17/1moment [7] 16/2 18/1 26/13 **my [19]** 4/4 4/17 4/18 5/3 30/10 30/12 41/20 66/7 5/7 5/7 6/6 10/19 11/9 17/20 42/5 42/12 49/3 18/13 18/18 18/25 21/8 21/18 36/1 52/23 54/18 68/12 26/14 67/16 myself [1] 64/9 moot [1] 39/1 9/17 15/21 17/21 24/22 27/17 30/19 35/9 35/13 name [2] 14/24 27/11 41/25 42/15 44/2 47/22 48/25 named [6] 5/19 13/22 14/1 52/17 58/20 59/20 59/22 14/24 36/24 38/7 59/24 62/9 64/23 68/25 **naming** [1] 31/19 33/13 nanograms [1] 34/13 morning [11] 2/5 3/1 3/24 Nathan [2] 14/23 44/4 **nature** [1] 69/4 4/2 4/8 4/10 4/12 4/14 41/17 **NDC [4]** 53/16 54/7 54/14 **most [2]** 55/17 66/20 55/10 NDCs [4] 53/22 54/1 56/16 mostly [2] 15/23 15/23 motion [31] 9/8 9/14 9/18 60/16 12/8 13/14 15/16 20/15 22/5 necessarily [3] 24/5 28/2 24/15 24/16 25/15 25/16 29/6 43/14 31/23 33/22 33/23 37/16 **need [16]** 4/24 5/12 9/17 39/17 42/4 42/13 42/15 42/15 9/17 19/15 36/6 38/7 48/25 43/21 43/22 48/9 55/10 57/15 49/13 54/7 56/20 56/23 58/9 62/24 66/12 66/14 67/12 65/19 66/20 67/8 motions [8] 16/6 25/10 29/3 **needed [3]** 12/14 37/8 38/4 29/3 39/9 52/19 52/20 59/1 needs [7] 21/18 21/21 22/4 **move [17]** 7/8 10/17 12/2 22/16 47/8 57/2 67/24 25/7 26/20 27/10 29/20 49/11 negligence [3] 12/17 14/8 49/11 55/2 55/9 56/1 58/9 44/10 58/24 59/15 62/18 62/20 **negotiate** [1] 30/17 moved [2] 15/10 16/22 negotiating [1] 63/24 moving [4] 11/10 13/9 22/2 negotiations [1] 30/19 **never [9]** 19/5 19/9 33/24 **MPIC** [5] 15/22 16/1 16/3 34/15 34/16 46/3 55/19 64/5 65/7 **new [14]** 2/2 11/4 22/17 25/6 Mr [47] 4/7 9/6 15/19 15/20 18/13 18/18 19/11 20/12 25/9 25/13 28/23 29/4 29/4 20/14 20/19 20/24 27/13 33/6 50/17 61/6 65/6 65/12 27/17 28/9 31/9 31/12 32/21 **newly [1]** 65/13 35/16 36/25 39/10 39/18 **next** [6] 29/20 30/5 58/24 64/7 67/16 69/11 39/22 41/14 41/21 41/24 42/1 42/6 42/6 44/6 44/9 44/22 **nice** [1] 4/14 45/14 46/14 46/15 46/20 **night** [1] 20/6 47/25 51/3 52/24 53/24 56/22 nine [2] 66/3 66/4 **no [39]** 1/3 9/8 12/15 13/6 57/21 60/6 60/19 64/4 64/15 15/10 15/12 16/2 17/14 23/23 24/6 24/17 25/12 27/21 28/10 Ms [5] 15/20 18/18 28/7 28/13 28/15 29/16 31/17 **Ms.** [7] 20/12 30/12 52/11 32/14 32/17 32/25 34/2 36/21 37/3 38/20 38/21 43/2 44/16 52/24 53/24 56/22 63/15 Ms. Johnston [1] 20/12 46/5 46/13 47/21 49/5 58/9 59/20 60/15 65/10 67/7 67/9 Ms. Zousmer [6] 30/12 52/11 68/4 52/24 53/24 56/22 63/15 **nobody [2]** 47/15 54/8 much [9] 4/16 14/7 20/2 54/19 58/24 65/17 68/8 68/20 **non [30]** 6/4 19/17 25/14 28/23 49/15 50/1 50/3 50/5

muchly [1]

49/9

	<u>, </u>	
N	44/25 47/13 48/8 62/21 67/23	52/15 52/15 62/3 65/6 65/10
	occur [2] 22/16 42/10	66/18 66/21 67/1 67/14
non [22] 50/6 50/11 50/12	occurs [1] 60/14	out [27] 4/18 7/1 12/2 18/5
50/20 50/21 50/23 51/7 51/8	of applying [1] 43/18	21/18 31/15 34/12 36/17 39/9
51/10 51/13 51/19 51/21 52/3	of what [1] 43/10	39/21 40/17 41/11 43/7 43/20
52/10 53/7 53/11 56/16 58/1	off [8] 10/11 24/23 40/18	48/10 48/14 52/4 57/22 59/14
58/2 58/3 58/7 58/11	48/4 49/12 65/8 68/10 69/6	60/10 62/8 67/12 67/19 68/16
non-designated [26] 6/4	offer [1] 67/25	68/19 68/24 69/5
19/17 49/15 50/1 50/3 50/5		
50/6 50/11 50/12 50/20 50/21	Official [1] 69/20	outcome [1] 67/14
50/23 51/7 51/8 51/10 51/13	oh [3] 48/15 64/16 64/24	outline [1] 68/17
51/19 51/21 52/3 52/10 53/7	okay [21] 3/23 20/21 27/8	outright [1] 55/13
53/11 58/1 58/2 58/3 58/7	28/7 29/13 31/8 35/3 35/7	outside [1] 60/20
non-designated cancer [1]	41/14 41/14 45/14 48/17	over [11] 5/3 18/13 20/18
58/11	49/16 49/25 56/3 57/7 58/19	23/21 31/1 32/23 43/3 56/4
non-MDL [1] 25/14	63/1 64/21 65/17 66/23	56/10 64/3 67/15
non-registrant [1] 28/23	once [8] 3/15 6/22 15/25	<pre>overlap [2] 4/20 68/12</pre>
nonbrand [11] 11/9 11/13	43/5 46/11 54/5 59/6 60/7	<pre>overlapping [1] 5/5</pre>
	one [37] 3/14 4/1 4/9 4/21	own [9] 17/25 25/1 25/6
11/15 14/6 16/17 17/14 18/7	4/23 5/10 7/17 9/14 11/12	26/19 27/7 47/4 51/21 62/9
35/13 41/9 41/23 69/3	12/3 12/19 14/18 14/21 15/8	63/6
nonbrands [14] 9/2 10/23	19/17 24/22 24/22 30/10	
11/1 13/2 17/11 27/16 30/7	38/21 42/16 44/2 45/25 47/10	P
31/10 31/23 35/14 35/17	49/10 50/20 50/23 51/15	p.m [2] 66/16 67/3
41/15 44/19 47/17	51/23 52/9 52/25 54/9 55/17	packed [1] 18/14
nonfinal [1] 46/8	56/21 58/7 59/2 63/14 67/8	page [6] 9/10 13/20 15/20
nonmovants [1] 41/25	ones [6] 8/20 32/3 34/1	40/18 40/20 40/22
nonparties [1] 41/24	34/25 53/9 53/10	paired [1] 15/25
nonparty [5] 33/9 33/14	only [22] 5/19 11/7 11/20	PALM [3] 1/2 1/5 2/13
33/15 33/21 33/22	13/21 13/25 15/3 16/22 19/1	panel [2] 60/23 61/5
normal [1] 42/7		
normally [3] 32/10 34/18	33/22 36/11 37/20 38/1 38/10	paragraph [1] 40/24
46/6	38/11 38/12 39/2 39/6 39/24	part [15] 8/1 8/24 13/18
normally obtains [1] 34/18	40/6 44/13 50/20 59/16	13/19 16/20 29/20 30/5 30/15
not [96]	open [6] 33/1 41/5 59/1	31/11 41/6 44/22 51/7 51/13
note [2] 41/23 44/2	60/10 60/14 60/16	56/13 57/1
noted [3] 4/7 14/2 14/7	operative [1] 16/3	part the [1] 13/19
notes [3] 4/18 5/3 5/8	opinion [2] 29/9 31/15	partial [1] 37/22
nothing [2] 40/8 47/20	opinions [2] 29/2 37/4	participants [1] 31/2
notice [9] 33/9 37/21 38/2	opportunity [19] 18/19 20/17	<pre>participate [1] 35/2</pre>
38/11 50/11 50/20 50/25 53/6	21/16 21/21 22/5 23/19 28/4	<pre>particular [2] 51/10 65/1</pre>
54/23	29/6 33/3 33/6 33/10 37/1	particularly [1] 11/3
notion [1] 24/11	41/5 41/12 43/23 49/5 64/16	<pre>parties [18] 5/25 7/2 11/6</pre>
November [5] 37/22 38/10	66/18 66/22	11/23 12/14 13/13 16/16
	oppose [3] 26/25 46/17 52/20	16/23 17/6 17/16 26/11 32/11
38/16 38/23 40/10	opposed [2] 22/8 34/16	32/15 33/18 33/20 37/10 43/6
November 2021 [4] 37/22	or multi-Plaintiff [1] 8/10	43/8
38/10 38/16 38/23	order [76]	<pre>parties' [3] 13/1 37/16</pre>
now [30] 9/3 11/19 13/13	order PTO [1] 63/21	43/25
14/18 15/19 18/22 20/18 23/2	orders [9] 4/24 19/19 28/18	partner [1] 4/4
26/1 26/6 30/6 31/12 34/25	31/3 36/14 46/8 46/9 65/12	party [6] 12/15 12/20 25/18
36/10 37/11 37/14 38/24	68/24	26/2 33/23 66/12
39/12 39/17 39/19 40/7 42/23	ordinary [4] 14/8 25/1 25/8	passed [4] 11/20 14/12 38/24
46/5 48/15 50/16 52/25 53/7	27/5	42/23
60/25 64/8 68/21	Ostrow [1] 1/13	passes [1] 54/5
NPIC [1] 41/1	other [35] 3/20 5/6 10/1	passing [1] 66/19
<pre>number [5] 14/21 19/7 44/4</pre>	14/6 16/22 17/13 21/24 23/11	
61/6 63/14		path [2] 39/20 64/20
NW [1] 2/5	23/20 24/4 29/4 29/13 30/5	
NY [1] 2/2		
	43/6 47/1 47/12 50/22 51/1	Pauline [3] 2/12 49/18 69/20
0	52/24 54/18 57/21 59/1 60/9	Peachtree [1] 1/21
objection [1] 32/23	60/15 63/11 65/19 65/20	pendency [1] 60/11
objections [2] 19/20 19/21	65/23 65/24 68/4	pending [5] 6/4 16/1 19/3
obligation [2] 48/12 51/11	other's [1] 51/23	39/9 60/8
observed [1] 7/12	others [4] 23/16 25/5 51/18	Pennsylvania [1] 2/5
obtain [2] 14/4 27/6	51/24	people [9] 29/4 29/4 31/18
obtains [1] 34/18	otherwise [2] 7/3 18/2	34/23 54/9 54/13 54/14 58/2
Omegains [1] Oalto	our [22] 3/9 19/5 19/20	59/22
obvious [11 68/6		
obvious [1] 68/6		per [2] 34/13 67/3
obvious [1] 68/6 obviously [7] 19/18 22/13	19/21 20/7 30/1 35/25 37/18 39/7 39/19 42/6 45/12 47/19	<pre>per [2] 34/13 67/3 percent [1] 62/15</pre>

	T	T
P	69/2	58/2 58/3
	possess [1] 15/15	proceeding [1] 36/8
perhaps [5] 13/5 52/13 52/25	possibility [6] 13/9 14/3	proceedings [1] 69/17
54/8 54/19	33/1 34/3 38/17 39/21	process [32] 11/4 12/14
period [1] 7/3	possible [3] 6/4 6/8 14/14	19/24 21/12 21/19 21/24 22/1
permission [4] 11/21 14/15	post [19] 10/1 10/2 10/5	22/8 22/21 22/25 24/1 24/12
14/19 42/4	10/7 10/12 12/5 23/3 27/15	27/5 27/6 27/23 27/25 30/25
permits [1] 67/23		
permutations [1] 67/15	27/22 27/23 29/10 29/18	30/25 34/18 35/2 36/7 47/23
person [5] 14/20 24/13 24/14	52/15 59/13 61/17 62/1 62/3	49/14 53/2 57/2 57/17 57/19
26/12 64/10	63/13 69/3	61/17 62/5 64/18 65/9 68/21
person's [1] 26/23	posture [2] 55/25 59/19	produced [2] 50/14 50/15
personal [1] 4/24	potential [1] 68/22	product [1] 47/4
	<pre>potentially [3] 21/13 26/5</pre>	productive [1] 20/12
persons [1] 22/23	48/2	PRODUCTS [2] 1/5 3/2
perspective [2] 18/6 35/25	practice [1] 31/24	<pre>promptly [1] 20/3</pre>
pertain [1] 13/2	pre [10] 12/5 27/15 27/22	<pre>proper [2] 46/18 65/16</pre>
phase [1] 56/8	29/17 52/15 59/13 59/24	<pre>properly [3] 31/20 47/8</pre>
phon [1] 26/9	61/21 63/13 69/2	48/13
PI [1] 49/15	precise [1] 69/1	proposal [7] 6/17 7/11 11/6
Pierce [1] 2/13		
pill [1] 34/13	precluded [1] 39/12	12/25 39/19 50/9 54/15
pin [1] 24/23	<pre>preemption [3] 5/16 21/12</pre>	propose [1] 23/1
place [4] 12/8 20/2 27/24	37/8	proposed [20] 6/13 6/14 6/22
68/21	preemptive [1] 37/6	7/2 7/12 9/4 10/4 10/15 11/6
Plaintiff [32] 5/19 8/6 8/9	<pre>prefaced [1] 44/7</pre>	12/24 18/23 19/16 20/4 20/9
	<pre>prejudice [3] 32/13 57/13</pre>	29/25 38/9 50/8 52/14 52/18
8/10 9/10 12/21 14/3 14/22	57/19	53/19
21/12 21/15 21/25 22/3 25/1	<pre>prepare [1] 53/20</pre>	protocols [1] 34/15
25/6 25/13 25/14 26/10 27/6	<pre>prepared [6] 4/18 5/25 17/19</pre>	
29/15 30/11 30/20 33/2 34/21	41/4 41/11 66/17	50/13
36/23 36/24 38/2 38/17 38/21	preparing [1] 12/24	<pre>provided [3] 3/8 12/1 37/5</pre>
39/2 41/3 50/13 67/23	present [2] 21/13 62/11	provided [3] 378 1271 3773
Plaintiff's [2] 22/6 51/14	-	
plaintiffs [46] 1/11 3/25	presented [2] 5/14 34/16	provision [4] 40/11 40/12
5/15 6/11 9/12 13/23 14/8	presenting [2] 3/10 3/14	40/12 40/14
14/12 14/14 15/8 18/9 18/11	preserve [1] 47/19	provisions [1] 53/9
19/20 20/23 21/10 21/22 23/9	preserves [1] 19/20	PTO [16] 9/4 10/16 11/6
23/11 23/22 25/9 25/11 26/6	pressure [1] 11/4	17/25 30/15 30/22 30/25 31/6
26/17 26/18 29/12 32/2 36/10	<pre>presumably [2] 8/4 14/20</pre>	50/8 63/20 63/21 63/22 65/10
	presumably the [1] 14/20	65/10 67/12 67/25
36/16 37/1 37/6 37/8 38/20	presume [1] 55/1	PTOs [4] 21/5 30/17 63/24
42/23 49/20 52/5 52/7 57/10	presuming [1] 54/8	63/25
3//13 30/12 30/13 39/1 39/12	<pre>pretrial [5] 7/12 12/21</pre>	pull [1] 26/13
60/5 61/21 62/4 66/10	36/14 38/25 67/18	pulled [2] 14/18 44/11
Plaintiffs' [12] 18/3 32/23	pretty [3] 48/3 68/7 68/20	purpose [1] 43/18
36/16 36/18 37/3 43/9 45/16		
47/14 47/17 51/6 56/11 61/16	previous [3] 21/25 32/12	purposes [6] 7/22 22/8 41/19
plan [1] 49/2	33/21	42/8 42/20 49/17
plate [2] 24/16 53/14	previously [4] 11/17 32/5	pursuant [4] 12/21 21/5
platform [1] 3/3	37/18 40/2	32/16 38/25
Plaza [1] 1/17	principal [1] 60/7	pursue [11] 50/12 50/21 51/1
	printout [1] 9/13	51/7 51/12 51/18 53/12 53/16
pleade [1] 14/6	prior [11] 7/14 13/7 19/5	56/8 56/12 56/16
please [5] 20/25 49/19 52/6	22/3 30/3 41/6 46/4 46/9	pursue certain [1] 51/18
	60/16 61/19 62/17	<pre>put [3] 24/23 48/12 68/13</pre>
66/10 66/18	<pre>privy [2] 45/11 62/22</pre>	putting [1] 16/3
pled [1] 12/17	pro [4] 50/5 53/7 56/19	
plus [1] 26/17	56/24	Q
point [8] 43/5 44/15 47/2	probably [4] 55/17 64/18	qualify [1] 6/1
47/25 54/12 58/5 60/18 64/15	64/19 66/24	question [27] 5/10 10/18
<pre>pointed [1] 36/17</pre>		10/23 11/9 11/22 12/3 16/24
points [2] 7/1 47/1	problem [1] 62/12	
Ponce [1] 1/14	procedural [9] 17/14 23/24	22/21 25/22 32/22 35/22 36/9
Porter [1] 2/1	24/19 37/14 41/8 55/6 55/25	39/17 45/5 45/19 50/18 52/8
position [24] 7/25 11/2 20/7	62/5 64/2	52/9 52/12 53/3 55/24 56/5
21/9 27/20 41/20 42/5 45/16	<pre>procedurally [6] 31/20 35/21</pre>	
45/24 46/21 46/22 47/14	35/21 41/11 65/15 67/13	questions [30] 4/5 4/19 5/14
	procedure [11] 5/24 12/24	5/24 7/6 7/10 7/17 10/19
47/18 48/20 51/20 54/6 55/21	24/8 24/11 25/2 27/7 35/25	12/3 12/19 13/15 17/6 17/17
61/3 61/16 61/16 62/1 62/3	42/1 49/6 61/18 68/7	17/21 18/14 19/14 20/19
62/16 65/6	procedures [1] 67/20	20/25 25/4 31/13 35/5 42/25
positions [3] 43/25 69/1	proceed [5] 51/6 56/7 58/1	43/24 47/11 58/20 59/24
	[

	2 242 02/14	
Q	regular [1] 23/14	rest [3] 16/4 61/25 69/11
questions [4] 65/24 66/2	rehash [1] 41/21	result [2] 13/6 33/16
	relate [2] 19/3 61/7	resulted [1] 32/12
66/5 68/4		retailer [3] 4/13 13/14 14/9
quickly [4] 40/4 47/1 54/20		
66/19	60/19	retailer/distributor [1]
quite [2] 17/24 32/19	relating [3] 18/22 18/24	13/14
	38/9	retailers [17] 5/1 12/11
quote [1] 14/2	relationship [1] 23/11	14/17 14/25 20/11 31/25
quoted [1] 32/5		
quoting [1] 15/19	relatively [2] 49/6 69/10	33/10 33/24 34/4 34/24 41/19
quocing [1] 10/19	reliable [1] 36/21	42/18 46/15 46/22 47/3 49/2
R	relief [2] 11/10 14/4	69/6
	relitigate [1] 26/23	retain [1] 20/23
raise [4] 21/16 22/17 22/18		
47/1	rely [1] 37/3	returned [1] 13/11
raised [2] 13/7 60/18	remain [5] 14/13 50/4 52/3	review [4] 3/6 6/6 47/24
	60/10 60/16	49/1
raising [1] 24/7	remained [1] 33/17	reviewing [1] 5/3
RANITIDINE [7] 1/4 17/2 17/2	remaining [3] 15/24 40/6	revise [1] 32/11
17/3 34/13 34/15 45/6		
RE [2] 1/4 3/2	50/1	revised [1] 32/17
	remains [3] 16/8 16/10 60/14	revisit [1] 40/3
reach [1] 62/8	remand [2] 43/17 59/1	revisited [1] 41/7
reacting [1] 45/6		right [26] 3/1 4/15 5/8
reaction [1] 45/12	remanded [1] 62/19	
readily [1] 10/6	remarks [1] 33/21	13/23 14/2 20/3 21/12 21/19
	remember [1] 18/15	23/2 25/18 26/25 29/23 38/14
ready [2] 65/21 67/24	remind [2] 36/6 64/9	39/19 46/6 48/17 52/25 55/2
realize [2] 18/6 46/16	removed [2] 63/8 64/6	57/24 58/19 61/18 64/21
really [8] 13/3 36/10 44/23		
45/9 47/1 54/12 60/18 64/14	renewed [1] 66/14	65/17 67/4 67/10 68/2
reason [13] 9/25 10/2 16/4	repackager [1] 14/25	rights [4] 27/5 27/6 47/19
	repetitive [1] 6/2	65/9
29/8 32/14 38/15 45/10 47/22	reply [4] 66/18 66/21 67/7	Riverside [1] 1/17
55/20 55/22 60/15 66/21 67/8		
reasons [5] 15/5 38/21 39/4	67/9	ROBERT [9] 1/12 3/25 18/10
48/2 48/6	report [2] 50/13 50/15	49/19 51/5 52/7 59/6 60/4
	Reporter [3] 2/12 69/20	66/9
recall [2] 4/23 37/4	69/21	ROBIN [3] 1/9 2/12 4/12
receive [4] 9/24 13/2 20/4	<u> </u>	
20/9	reports [4] 37/11 53/21	role [2] 22/14 50/25
received [5] 15/3 17/23	53/23 54/13	ROSENBERG [3] 1/3 1/9 2/12
39/15 40/8 55/19	represent [4] 22/12 30/18	route [1] 68/1
	50/24 51/1	rule [42] 5/15 13/7 13/12
receiving [1] 17/25	represented [4] 12/24 53/6	13/19 13/19 13/20 14/5 14/10
recent [1] 26/15	56/19 57/24	15/3 15/12 23/22 25/9 32/4
recently [2] 44/3 44/14		
recognized [1] 46/19	representing [1] 63/3	32/7 32/9 32/15 32/21 32/23
recognizes [1] 6/19	request [5] 9/15 39/8 39/22	33/8 33/19 34/11 39/5 39/11
	39/23 39/24	39/13 40/6 43/3 45/16 45/17
record [21] 3/17 3/22 16/20	requesting [1] 11/10	45/19 46/2 46/3 46/3 46/8
19/23 25/4 27/12 34/8 34/9		46/11 46/23 46/24 47/8 47/21
45/22 45/23 45/24 46/7 47/7	require [1] 53/13	
49/16 49/17 56/14 59/5 65/5	required [1] 22/2	47/21 48/15 57/13 65/14
	requirements [3] 57/10 57/17	ruled [3] 29/3 36/4 39/21
66/17 68/14 69/17	57/18	rules [11] 24/8 24/19 24/24
recounting [1] 56/9	requires [1] 53/14	24/24 25/2 26/3 27/7 28/1
reduce [1] 61/6	reserve [1] 30/10	39/8 42/7 67/11
referenced [3] 26/12 41/24		
63/20	resistence [1] 39/20	ruling [39] 5/25 8/2 9/15
references [1] 36/15	resolve [1] 6/4	13/10 13/10 13/18 14/6 16/2
	respect [32] 10/23 21/2 25/6	16/12 16/14 16/18 16/19
referred [2] 18/23 36/15	25/8 26/3 28/8 28/18 30/1	16/23 16/25 17/1 17/8 17/10
referring [6] 30/14 30/22		
30/24 31/7 40/11 40/19	31/13 32/3 32/18 32/21 32/22	
refile [1] 66/14	33/4 33/6 33/13 34/15 34/23	39/18 41/9 43/2 43/16 43/18
	34/25 43/8 45/24 47/3 47/16	43/19 46/3 46/16 51/15 60/9
refiled [1] 66/14	47/20 50/1 53/21 55/21 57/9	65/11 65/14 65/15 66/19
regard [6] 19/17 19/18 20/11	57/21 61/16 68/22 69/2	66/20 67/19 67/23
28/22 62/1 62/15		
regardless [5] 8/9 17/4	respectfully [2] 27/1 34/5	rulings [8] 5/16 15/16 15/21
67/11 67/13 67/19	respects [1] 3/4	16/2 19/22 28/3 41/23 42/17
	respond [4] 20/17 22/5 40/4	running [1] 23/8
registrant [1] 28/23	55/17	
registrants [4] 28/16 28/18	1	S
28/20 31/1	responding [2] 4/5 10/20	
registry [16] 6/10 8/4 8/14	response [6] 6/6 39/10 39/13	said [14] 9/11 12/14 17/22
8/22 9/19 30/16 31/6 36/17	66/15 66/24 67/8	28/5 29/16 30/13 32/20 33/21
	responsibilities [3] 23/9	41/21 46/20 49/2 51/5 56/25
40/17 63/16 63/23 63/23 64/5	23/12 23/13	63/15
65/3 65/8 65/8	responsibility [1] 51/14	same [16] 3/11 5/24 7/21
	responsibility [1] 21/14	Same [10] 3/11 3/24 1/21
T .	İ	

35/9

40/22

1/1 1/10 6/18

1/9 3/4 3/5 3/12

6/11

6/14

37/9

46/4

30/16

6/2

26/6 45/19

4/9 18/23 21/15

```
15/18 15/25 31/16 33/18 34/2 | Spalding [2] 1/21 1/24
S
                               34/23 38/18 38/22 39/3 41/3
                                                            speak [4]
                                                                      18/19 30/6 31/24
same... [13] 10/2 14/7 16/9
                               44/4
                                                             35/17
23/12 29/8 30/20 47/2 56/18
                              should [40] 3/19 5/11 5/12
                                                            speakers [1]
58/16 58/16 61/16 62/23 65/9
                               5/24 6/3 6/4 6/24 7/1 10/10
                                                            speaking [5]
sampled [1] 50/4
                               10/25 13/2 15/16 23/25 24/19
                                                             44/11 63/3
Sanofi [1] 63/3
                                                            special [2] 3/9 17/23
                               27/24 28/13 28/20 28/24
satisfied [2] 54/15 55/8
                                                            specific [3] 34/7 41/25 45/4
                               31/19 35/19 35/20 39/5 39/24
satisfy [1] 55/8
                                                            specifically [4] 18/22 18/24
                               45/7 47/11 47/14 47/20 48/6
         7/20 9/16 13/16
say [49]
                               49/5 55/3 55/13 59/19 59/19
                                                             19/18 43/17
15/17 18/17 19/15 19/16
                               61/1 61/1 61/3 61/15 62/16
                                                            spending [1]
19/23 20/7 21/17 23/17 24/10
                                                            spoken [2] 29/16 59/17
                               64/14 64/16
 24/11 24/17 25/15 25/22 27/1
                              shouldn't [8] 6/25 10/24
                                                            stages [1] 69/11
 27/17 30/23 32/6 32/14 33/14
                               22/1 48/5 55/16 61/4 61/19
                                                            stand [2]
                                                                      50/24 67/24
 35/8 36/10 37/11 45/9 45/15
                               61/20
                                                            start [1]
                                                                       35/14
 45/15 45/22 45/25 47/10
                              show [12] 21/24 21/25 24/4
                                                            started [2] 67/2 67/14
 47/25 48/4 48/15 54/12 55/15
                               27/24 55/3 55/13 55/15 55/16
                                                            starting [1]
 55/19 62/8 64/4 64/7 64/11
                               55/23 57/17 61/18 64/18
                                                            state [7] 3/16 3/21 27/11
 64/16 64/18 64/19 65/22
                                                             31/4 49/17 59/4 64/6
                              shown [1]
                                        55/22
65/25 66/3 67/4 67/11
                                        22/3
                                                            stated [1]
                              shows [1]
saying [7] 9/7 9/14 24/1 30/17 31/20 40/7 44/7
                              side [4] 36/2 44/2 52/24
                                                            statement [1]
                               54/18
                                                            states [3]
saying January [1] 9/7
                              sides [1]
                                        43/23
                                                            status [9]
says [6] 7/2 13/10 32/9
                              Signature [1]
                                            69/21
                                                             12/23 17/20 35/10 51/4 68/3
40/25 45/4 46/8
                              significance [2]
                                               21/6 21/7
                                                            Statute [1] 68/23
scenes [1] 18/2
                              significant [2]
                                               25/5 37/5
                                                            stay [1]
                                                                      61/1
schedule [2] 54/7 68/19
                              similar [3] 52/21 61/20
                                                            step [6] 24/16 52/25 53/2
Scholer [1] 2/1
                                                             53/14 53/19 55/6
                               63/11
scope [1] 30/21
                                         6/17 53/12
                              simple [2]
                                                            stick [1]
                                                                      27/2
screen [3] 3/20 4/22 5/9
                                                            still [18] 11/15 14/3 15/8
                              simply [1] 61/1
       50/5 53/7 56/19 56/24
se [4]
                              since [5] 18/21 19/25 23/6
                                                             17/7 17/8 25/7 31/18 32/4
second [8] 10/18 10/22 19/15
                               31/9 38/23
                                                             32/11 33/7 33/17 34/1 38/7
30/9 31/11 50/14 55/9 56/1
                                                             44/15 46/23 56/17 62/23
                              single [1]
                                         55/21
section [1] 12/21
                              singular [1] 36/8
                                                             68/21
see [16] 3/19 3/20 4/14 12/6
                              sit [2] 4/16 7/7
                                                            Stipes [2] 2/12 69/20
27/21 27/22 35/7 47/15 49/11
                              sitting [1] 23/16
                                                            straight [1] 47/23
53/25 54/21 57/25 65/22
                                                            straightforward [1] 6/18
                              situation [1] 64/17
65/25 66/24 67/15
                              six [2] 12/3 66/1
                                                            strange [1] 23/10
seek [6] 15/9 16/24 22/16
                              slightly [1] 15/24
                                                            streamlined [2] 21/23 57/2
39/2 42/24 46/16
                                                            Street [4] 1/21 1/24 2/2 2/8
                              slowed [1]
                                         47/22
seeking [2]
            31/19 42/16
                              small [1] 15/2
                                                            struggle [1] 39/14
seem [5] 6/8 13/4 16/21 24/5
                              so [107]
                                                            styled [1]
50/15
                                                            subject [7] 8/5 8/6 13/14
                              solely [4] 17/2 18/22 18/24
seemed [3] 5/4 8/17 13/1
                               19/3
                                                             26/17 31/3 32/25 50/23
seems [4] 6/17 15/2 16/7
                              solicit [1] 57/3
                                                            submit [2] 53/21 54/15
16/8
                              some [23] 3/6 4/20 5/14 8/24
                                                            submitted [11] 10/4 18/24
seen [3] 21/24 34/2 66/24
                               9/25 15/14 15/14 17/21 17/22
                                                             19/17 29/25 38/8 52/14 53/1
send [1]
         62/8
                               18/12 21/13 22/1 27/23 28/3
                                                             56/22 57/11 58/20 68/13
sends [1] 61/13
                               36/15 38/19 39/11 50/4 57/16
                                                            submitting [1] 12/25
sense [6]
          23/2 23/20 48/24
                               58/15 59/17 61/18 67/7
                                                            subpoenaed [1]
57/25 58/7 58/13
                              somehow [2] 37/11 62/8
                                                            Subsection [1]
sent [2] 7/12 26/18
                              someone [6] 21/20 25/23 26/2
                                                            subsequent [3]
series [1] 31/12
                               26/11 26/15 48/6
                                                             57/22
set [7] 23/12 30/21 30/25
                              something [16] 9/3 12/7
                                                            subsequently [1] 40/15
36/4 52/17 60/21 68/19
                               18/17 21/11 21/23 27/25 34/7
                                                            substitute [1] 22/25
sets [2] 31/6 67/19
                               41/13 48/14 49/3 61/5 61/20
                                                            subsume [1]
seven [11] 3/14 4/1 4/21
                                                            subsumes [2] 45/17 45/23
                               64/2 64/19 65/22 66/3
4/25 7/8 12/2 12/10 31/11
                              soon [2] 6/3 6/8
                                                            such [4] 6/21 38/22 41/3
31/13 49/10 66/1
                              sorry [4] 30/4 33/14 44/2
                                                             51/23
several [2] 7/6 19/6
                                                            sued [1] 17/5
                               45/18
SFCs [1] 16/4
                                                            suggest [3] 6/8 21/6 24/3
                              sort [11] 4/23 5/11 10/20
shall [1] 41/2
                               17/19 22/1 24/18 27/14 58/15
                                                            suggested [4] 44/9 52/24
share [1] 15/6
                               60/10 61/9 68/5
                                                             54/18 68/8
shared [1] 3/10
                              sorted [2]
                                         39/9 59/14
                                                            suggestion [1] 36/25
she [2] 3/9 50/11
                                                            Suite [3] 1/14 1/18 1/21
                              sorts [1]
                                        52/17
short [24] 9/12 11/12 11/14
                              sought [1]
                                         5/15
                                                            sum [1] 31/14
11/18 11/20 12/15 12/16 13/5
                                                            summarizing [1]
                              sounds [1]
                                          29/14
14/13 14/15 14/23 15/9 15/11
                              SOUTHERN [3] 1/1 11/24 42/7
                                                            summary [31] 6/6 7/15 7/24
```

```
55/21 56/23 57/5 59/4 61/1
                                                             34/17 46/7 52/22 53/12 53/16
S
                               62/6 62/7 62/9 63/6 63/16
                                                             56/8 56/16 56/23 62/5
                9/16 16/12
summary... [28]
                               68/23
                                                            throughout [1] 19/1
19/22 22/5 22/18 25/8 25/9
                              them [38] 5/6 7/7 15/14 17/7
                                                            throw [3] 21/18 48/9 54/20
25/16 26/22 26/25 28/5 28/19
                               18/15 18/15 18/21 20/3 20/5
                                                            throwing [1] 48/5
30/7 33/8 33/11 33/22 33/23
                               20/8 26/22 30/19 34/12 34/17
                                                            thrust [1] 9/3
33/25 34/7 43/13 43/13 45/22
                               34/20 34/22 35/1 46/9 46/10
                                                            time [31] 3/13 4/17 6/3
45/23 46/6 47/7 60/9 61/22
                               46/12 46/25 47/5 47/6 51/13
                                                             11/12 11/19 18/5 19/3 20/6
62/18
                               53/14 53/20 55/13 55/17
                                                             29/23 33/12 35/9 37/21 37/24
summer [1] 31/1
                               55/17 56/25 57/3 57/16 61/13
                                                             38/12 38/14 38/23 39/25 40/2
support [1] 43/20
                                                             42/22 43/15 53/22 54/5 56/10
                               61/15 61/22 62/8 63/25 65/14
suppose [5] 12/12 27/16 33/5
                              themselves [6] 16/17 16/23
                                                             63/5 65/4 65/7 65/13 65/13
35/12 37/10
                               17/11 17/15 21/13 65/12
                                                             67/2 68/20 69/9
Supreme [1] 26/9
                              then [23] 5/8 5/21 7/8 7/8
                                                            timely [1]
                                                                       68/25
sure [11] 19/12 25/21 27/13
                               8/19 9/13 10/2 12/5 13/4
                                                            times [1]
                                                                      11/3
29/23 36/1 40/5 48/22 52/2
                               18/4 29/1 30/11 35/16 35/17
                                                            timing [3]
                                                                       42/8 42/25 47/11
52/12 68/15 69/7
                               42/20 43/3 43/19 46/1 46/7
                                                                        3/10 4/9 23/17
                                                            today [15]
surrounding [1] 13/15
                                                             24/3 26/16 38/9 38/17 41/4
                               53/20 57/3 63/16 66/15
surviving [1] 16/1
                              theoretical [4] 14/3 33/1
                                                             48/23 60/22 66/16 67/1 68/6
                               34/1 34/3
                                                             68/16 69/5
                              theoretically [2] 14/14 24/2
                                                            today's [1]
                                                                        20/16
tab [1]
        23/8
                              theory [1]
                                                            together [3]
                                                                         5/6 10/20 54/10
tagged [1] 60/20
                              there [91]
                                                            tolling [1] 6/9
take [7] 13/4 18/1 20/23
                              thereafter [2] 53/20 62/18
                                                            tomorrow [3] 21/21 68/17
45/25 64/5 64/15 69/13
                              thereby [1]
                                          39/12
                                                             69/5
taken [3] 46/2 47/8 63/11
                              therefore [2] 15/2 21/16
                                                            too [4] 34/24 52/25 54/19
takes [1]
          49/10
                              Thereupon [1] 69/14
                                                             54/19
taking [2] 52/25 61/3
                              these [37] 4/4 4/5 4/19 9/15
                                                           took [5] 12/8 20/2 20/8
talk [3] 5/5 9/2 27/16
                               9/16 11/4 13/15 15/14 16/6
                                                             57/22 62/1
talked [1] 59/10
                               18/3 19/1 19/12 29/23 30/19
                                                                       4/9 4/21 4/21
                                                            topic [35]
talking [2] 53/8 55/18
                               35/9 35/10 35/24 38/6 39/23
                                                             4/23 4/24 4/25 5/10 6/12 7/8
tasked [1] 64/13
                               43/21 45/3 45/9 47/12 47/24
                                                             12/2 12/3 12/9 13/3 13/16
tat [1] 20/6
                               48/19 49/6 50/15 54/2 54/7
                                                             23/20 27/18 27/19 29/14
team [2] 56/6 57/5
                               54/14 54/17 54/20 55/11
                                                             29/20 29/21 30/5 31/11 31/13
technical [1] 64/15
                               55/25 57/15 57/17 69/2
                                                             49/12 49/14 58/25 58/25
technically [3] 32/4 41/25
                              they [133]
                                                             60/16 65/25 65/25 66/1 66/2
60/11
                              thing [1] 66/20
                                                             66/2 66/3 66/4
tell [4] 3/19 47/19 53/15
                              things [8] 17/22 31/14 42/16 topics [16] 3/6 3/8 3/11
53/15
                              48/1 51/5 54/17 54/20 69/4
                                                             3/14 3/15 3/25 4/5 4/20 5/6
tens [1] 9/12
                              think [73]
                                                             18/12 35/9 35/10 49/10 65/19
tension [1] 46/14
                              thinking [8] 4/19 7/9 21/9
                                                             65/20 65/23
terms [8] 23/2 24/9 28/11
                               24/20 35/19 45/2 45/2 69/11
                                                            toss [1] 48/14
28/23 41/25 42/24 43/10
                              third [2] 11/22 37/10
                                                            totality [1] 7/9
48/10
                              this [105]
                                                            touched [1] 22/15
test [1] 34/12
                                         2/7 4/8 29/22
                                                            tough [1] 3/18
                              THOMAS [4]
tested [1] 36/19
                               35/23
                                                            toward [1] 36/8
testify [1] 34/14
                              those [54] 3/10 3/13 3/15
                                                            transcript [4] 5/4 6/7 9/10
testing [1] 34/14
                               8/3 9/14 9/19 10/9 10/12
                                                             69/16
text [1] 32/9
                               14/11 15/4 16/14 17/9 17/17
                                                            transfer [2] 22/9 60/21
than [4] 31/18 32/3 52/17
                               19/19 21/21 22/17 23/13
                                                            transferee [1] 60/22
55/7
                               23/22 25/8 25/9 25/11 28/20
                                                            transferor [7] 61/2 62/9
thank [17] 18/10 20/21 20/22
                               28/25 29/4 33/18 34/16 34/25
                                                             62/10 62/19 62/21 62/24 63/6
27/19 28/8 35/23 44/1 44/18
                               38/11 39/4 39/9 40/6 43/6
                                                            transferred [14] 8/11 8/21
49/9 52/6 57/7 64/22 65/17
                               43/8 43/14 46/11 46/13 46/19
                                                             9/20 10/1 19/8 21/2 21/4
67/22 68/2 69/9 69/13
                               48/3 48/11 49/16 51/8 53/6
                                                             23/3 27/21 28/9 29/17 59/1
Thanks [1] 58/24
                               54/10 55/10 56/9 56/13 57/4
                                                             61/6 62/3
that [498]
                               57/12 60/10 61/1 63/19 64/1
                                                            transferring [2] 19/9 59/22
that would [1]
               42/10
                               65/4 65/12
                                                            treat [1] 10/5
that's [1] 13/8
                              though [3] 21/7 41/15 46/23
                                                            treated [5] 7/21 10/10 10/13
the extent [1] 29/24
                              thought [3] 10/16 53/24
                                                             28/20 28/21
the generic's [1] 46/21
                                                            trial [4] 45/21 45/23 45/23
                              57/24
their [42] 8/16 10/12 11/14
                              thoughts [1] 15/7
                                                             46/7
13/23 14/2 14/13 14/15 15/9
                              thousand [1] 26/17
                                                            tried [1]
                                                                      20/24
15/20 15/24 16/3 16/5 18/19
                                                                      34/4 44/10 44/17
                              thousands [1] 9/12
                                                            truck [3]
 20/9 26/19 29/2 30/19 37/1
                              three [6] 15/12 22/19 22/19
                                                            True [1] 15/14
 37/4 37/11 44/23 50/21 51/12
                              38/21 40/24 49/14
                                                            truly [1]
                                                                      52/10
 51/12 51/21 51/22 53/13
                                                            try [2] 20/19 68/24
                              three-year [1] 22/19
 53/21 53/23 53/23 55/10
                              through [12] 1/9 14/16 21/17 trying [3] 26/23 45/24 61/14
```

Т **viable [1]** 15/25 view [9] 7/20 9/25 16/9 18/4 **Tuesday [1]** 66/14 35/13 36/2 56/18 60/13 60/21 turn [4] 18/13 20/18 45/14 **views [1]** 30/1 56/4 **virtue [1]** 40/14 **two [13]** 9/22 15/9 15/10 **vis [4]** 47/12 47/12 67/20 17/6 22/11 38/6 42/16 49/12 67/20 52/17 54/15 55/11 57/22 47/12 67/20 vis-a-vis [2] 63/14 26/3 voluntary [1] two-fold [1] 17/6 **type [2]** 22/21 58/12 **types [2]** 58/16 58/16 wait [1] 10/24 **typical** [1] 63/11 waiting [1] 8/7 **typically [1]** 60/21 waive [3] 19/21 66/17 66/21 waived [3] 13/23 14/1 67/9 **wake [1]** 34/8 ultimately [6] 11/22 23/1 Wal [1] 47/4 24/9 47/17 56/11 68/1 Wal-Mart [1] 47/4 **under [17]** 11/4 26/8 27/7 want [30] 6/7 7/17 11/1 28/1 28/2 32/15 32/21 33/8 11/22 12/17 18/1 18/5 19/12 34/11 39/5 43/11 46/11 46/24 21/20 22/17 22/24 25/21 51/11 57/13 65/14 65/14 26/25 29/13 30/1 30/10 30/12 understand [16] 7/9 9/17 30/22 31/12 35/12 41/15 9/18 10/15 13/13 16/19 24/18 44/25 45/15 45/15 48/7 52/2 30/22 31/9 40/5 45/24 46/5 54/12 56/4 61/10 68/8 48/20 52/2 57/14 64/4 wanted [8] 9/21 27/17 31/8 understanding [2] 18/25 34/20 47/1 48/19 65/22 66/3 25/21 wants [2] 29/19 35/17 understands [1] 16/16 warned [1] 18/15 understood [1] 27/20 was [62] 5/3 5/10 6/7 7/15 unfortunately [1] 23/15 8/11 9/6 9/8 9/9 10/15 12/3 unilateral [1] 11/19 12/16 12/19 13/7 14/7 14/19 unilaterally [3] 11/18 14/13 16/25 17/1 17/5 19/13 19/13 38/18 19/17 20/15 24/14 25/15 **UNITED [2]** 1/1 1/10 25/15 29/11 30/24 31/11 32/5 unknown [1] 20/10 33/1 33/16 34/12 36/18 37/2 unless [3] 35/5 67/1 67/7 37/22 38/16 38/17 39/20 **Unlike [1]** 19/24 39/24 42/13 42/21 44/16 unpack [1] 20/19 45/25 46/4 48/21 49/25 52/14 unreasonable [1] 24/5 55/22 55/25 56/5 56/6 57/17 until [9] 8/16 8/18 8/19 57/19 61/14 61/22 65/22 10/24 20/5 20/8 34/1 39/8 66/12 66/13 66/14 67/2 68/14 67/2 69/14 **up [11]** 3/5 11/14 19/9 22/3 Washington [1] 2/6 24/16 36/4 47/23 52/1 53/14 wasn't [4] 21/15 36/10 44/12 66/4 68/6 66/11 upcoming [1] 69/12 way [9] 14/18 32/4 41/6 **upon [4]** 15/16 17/25 19/20 51/15 62/6 62/7 65/16 67/6 57/11 68/25 **ups [1]** 21/1 ways [1] 39/20 **urgent** [1] 67/5 we [177] **us [9]** 18/3 20/10 20/14 we'll [4] 46/17 47/19 58/24 20/19 36/3 37/10 41/24 44/25 67/8 66/13 we're [1] 55/18 **used [4]** 5/24 34/14 44/13 **we've [1]** 63/9 44/16 week [1] 66/12 **usually [1]** 4/18 weekend [1] 69/12 weeks [1] 67/16 weigh [1] 43/20 **variation** [1] 59/17 Weiselberg [1] 1/13**various** [1] 69/2 **welcome** [1] 48/8 **vehicle** [1] 41/8 well [13] 12/12 14/11 33/19 **version** [1] 14/24 36/10 38/20 45/21 47/3 53/4 **versus** [5] 21/2 22/8 22/14 61/10 61/12 64/14 65/21

67/17

went [1] 52/22

7/13 7/22 8/21 10/7 10/8

65/4 69/3

69/10

very [9] 14/14 15/3 18/17

19/2 30/1 37/15 65/17 69/10

12/9 13/11 13/22 14/1 17/19 17/21 17/24 19/3 19/8 20/1 20/6 20/15 25/19 26/14 26/15 26/18 29/5 30/16 30/17 31/2 31/9 32/22 33/23 35/10 36/7 37/6 37/7 37/11 38/10 41/24 42/3 42/10 42/13 43/17 44/11 44/15 45/25 50/3 52/25 56/10 57/15 58/17 62/8 63/16 65/2 65/18 65/23 68/3 weren't [1] 57/16 **WEST [4]** 1/2 1/5 2/2 2/13 what [76] whatever [5] 21/19 32/5 62/5 68/10 68/12 whatsoever [1] 36/12 when [22] 5/3 5/8 5/12 5/15 7/10 7/20 11/3 13/8 17/16 18/19 23/23 25/22 30/23 33/9 33/21 34/18 47/7 50/17 51/4 53/23 59/15 63/8 where [21] 13/21 13/21 13/22 13/25 14/1 14/22 17/24 21/24 24/18 30/15 32/19 37/21 38/2 38/6 38/7 38/11 40/1 40/23 51/24 55/10 60/13 whether [30] 8/21 10/16 10/25 13/2 16/17 21/3 21/4 22/16 27/24 31/1 36/13 41/5 44/15 45/5 52/11 53/6 53/15 54/3 54/4 54/4 54/6 56/19 58/6 59/16 59/17 61/13 62/2 62/17 63/18 65/7 which [34] 4/20 5/19 6/10 6/13 8/17 12/8 12/10 13/10 19/6 24/19 30/25 31/13 33/15 33/20 37/22 40/24 41/1 42/21 42/23 43/2 43/6 46/13 49/14 50/8 53/1 55/2 56/7 58/25 59/14 60/19 61/5 61/17 67/12 68/6 which an [1] 5/19 whichever [1] 22/2 while [6] 19/10 19/10 19/19 20/13 44/11 47/12 who [35] 3/10 3/13 3/18 17/4 18/2 18/5 21/20 22/3 22/17 23/11 24/13 24/14 25/6 26/12 26/13 26/15 26/17 27/6 28/16 28/18 28/25 29/16 33/2 35/17 39/11 49/16 50/6 53/7 53/13 56/20 57/4 57/4 57/10 65/3 65/4 whole [2] 36/5 52/20 **why [24]** 4/20 9/22 10/2 16/11 16/14 16/19 20/8 21/25 24/9 28/14 31/18 31/21 35/14 35/16 38/21 46/13 55/3 55/13 55/16 57/22 61/19 64/19 67/5 68/10 will [49] 3/10 3/16 3/21 4/4 4/9 7/2 7/8 7/8 8/4 8/13 9/2 11/9 18/18 20/23 23/19 41/19 41/23 42/4 43/15 43/20 45/8 45/14 47/10 48/23 50/12 50/13 52/11 54/4 54/5 54/23 were [57] 5/4 5/14 5/23 6/11 54/25 55/1 55/2 57/4 57/18 59/14 67/4 67/7 67/7 67/9

```
W
will... [9] 67/11 67/12
67/12 67/16 67/18 68/16
68/17 68/19 68/24
Williams [1] 15/20
willing [1] 66/21
wish [2] 56/20 57/4
within [1] 61/4
without [9] 10/11 14/19
24/10 28/3 31/23 36/12 42/23
51/22 56/8
won [1] 34/10
won't [1] 41/21
wonder [1] 61/15
words [3] 17/13 29/4 30/6
work [9] 29/2 41/12 51/23
51/25 51/25 54/10 62/11 63/8
67/16
worked [1] 19/2
workup [1] 62/22
world [1] 55/18
would [117]
wouldn't [10] 10/2 16/19
21/8 24/10 29/6 31/18 31/21
33/7 43/12 62/10
writing [1] 48/12
writing before [1] 48/12
wrong [1] 37/13
year [3] 22/19 64/7 64/8
years [2] 22/20 57/16
yes [15] 3/24 27/11 32/3
35/6 44/1 55/24 58/22 58/23
60/3 61/9 61/24 61/25 62/14
64/21 66/8
yesterday [1] 20/15
yet [4] 7/7 46/10 59/3 66/24
YOO [9] 2/7 4/8 29/22 35/16
35/23 41/21 46/15 46/20
47/25
Yoo's [1] 31/9
York [1] 2/2
you [212]
you're [1] 34/18
your [136]
Yours [1] 52/10
ZANTAC [2] 1/4 3/2
Zoom [4] 1/9 3/3 22/11 23/16
ZOUSMER [16] 1/23 4/4 4/6
18/18 27/12 28/7 30/12 36/14
49/23 52/11 52/24 53/24
56/22 57/8 63/15 63/20
```